



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, August 17, 2015

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

KIRK GRADIN – CHAIR (Consent Agenda Representative)

SCOTT HOPKINS – VICE-CHAIR

THIEP CUNG

COURTNEY JANE MILLER (Consent Agenda Landscape Representative)

STEPHANIE POOLE (Consent Agenda Representative)

AMY FITZGERALD TRIPP

WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: JOHN CAMPANELLA

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): SHEILA LODGE

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor

SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician

KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:01 p.m. by Vice-Chair Hopkins.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Hopkins, Miller, Poole, Tripp and Wittausch.

Members absent: Gradin and Cung.

Staff present: Gantz, Limón (present until 4:39 p.m.), and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment: No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **August 3, 2015**, as submitted. [*The August 3, 2015 Consent Minutes were approved and ratified at the previous Full Board meeting, and are now posted on the City website as a separate document.*]

Action: Poole/Wittausch, 4/0/1. Motion carried. (Wittausch abstained from Items 6, 7, and 8/Miller abstained from Item 1/Tripp abstained in general, Gradin/Cung absent).

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **August 10, 2015**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Howard Wittausch** and **Philip Suding** (Landscape Architect/HLC member).

Action: Poole/Miller, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Cung absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **August 17, 2015**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Stephanie Poole** and **Courtney Jane Miller**. [*These ratified Consent Minutes can be found as a separate posted document.*]

Action: Poole/Miller, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Cung absent).

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.
- a. Ms. Gantz announced that Chair Gradin and Board Member Cung will be absent from today's meeting.
 - b. Ms. Gantz reported the previous ABR approved 806 Alberta Avenue project has been appealed and an appeal hearing date has not been set yet.
 - c. Mr. Limón reported the recent loss of former Architectural Board of Review member and Planning Commissioner, Bruce Bartlett, DesignARC, Inc. co-founder and Architect, whose outstanding and lengthy service to the Santa Barbara community will be sorely missed. Information on planned services will be made available to Board members.
- E. Subcommittee Reports.
- Southern California Gas Company Advanced Meter Subcommittee Meeting met today at 2:00pm, and there isn't any new information to report.
 - An announcement was made that certain Board members will receive notification of upcoming meetings regarding the ABR Design Guidelines, Multi-Unit Design Guidelines, and Mixed-Use Design Guidelines.

DISCUSSION ITEM

1. PROPOSED GUIDELINE AMENDMENTS

(3:15) Related to backflow devices, electric vehicle chargers, and public art on private property.

Staff: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner

Actual time: 3:12 p.m.

Mr. Limón clarified that the purpose of the proposed amendments to the Guidelines is to expand the list of projects that are eligible for staff administrative approval and to facilitate quicker review of minor projects. Staff has further clarified issues raised by the ABR at a previous discussion held on March 16, 2015 relating to administrative approvals for bike racks, electrical vehicle charging and service equipment, and plumbing equipment back flow prevention devices. Additional review criteria is now proposed for how the Board would evaluate public art on private property. Mr. Limón requested additional guidance from the Board, if deemed necessary.

Staff has revised the guidelines to reflect the Board's previous comments to limit staff approvals to one or two traditional style electric vehicle chargers (EV) placed in less prominent locations, with any style deviations to be reviewed and approved by the ABR.

Current requirements are mainly directed toward *public* art on public property, for both proposed permanent and temporary art, i.e. murals, and include screening from public views. The current Guidelines do not include any design direction for art on *private* property, and requires additional criteria development for both permanent and temporary art elements and murals. The Board can refer items to the Visual Art in Public Places (VAPP) Subcommittee (in conjunction with the County Arts Advisory Board) for recommendations or suitability comments, but Applicants are increasingly reluctant to utilize this referral process.

New Guideline criteria includes relevance to the Santa Barbara area (without being critical of the art itself), preference for locations compatible with the surrounding environment (and/or out of the public view or away from historic sites), size of the art, and prohibits religious or political messages of any kind. Considerations for property rights and freedom of speech infringement are a concern.

Board Comments:

- 1) Board member Miller, as ABR liaison to the VAPP Subcommittee, requested clarification from staff as to the duties of the County Arts Advisory Board and how they differ from VAPP duties.
- 2) Board member Miller requested clarification of stipulations for *relevance of art to the surrounding area*. Mr. Limón stated that other cities have established *theme art* for specific locations, which is a method the ABR may consider adopting. Staff also recommended the Board continue to explain, with findings, why certain proposed art is or is not appropriate for the building and/or neighborhood.
- 3) Mr. Limón clarified for Board member Tripp that he had examples of guidelines other cities use to stipulate the type of approvable art they prefer for private and public buildings.
- 4) Mr. Limón clarified for Board member Wittausch that inclusion of the word “offensive” as a description of any type of art is too subjective by the artist and viewer and therefore not appropriate.
- 5) Mr. Limón clarified that staff have developed some *Exception to Criteria* language for inclusion into the Guidelines Criteria in order to allow the Boards and Commissions and City Council to make exceptions where the art proposal deviates from guidelines but is deemed acceptable for the location.
- 6) Mr. Limón welcomed feedback from the ABR and stated he will seek feedback from the HLC in the future for their criteria recommendations. Any new criteria changes will be made available to the Board.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW**2. 604 E COTA ST****C-M Zone****(3:45)**

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 031-222-001
 Application Number: MST2014-00220
 Owner: Hammer Properties, LLC
 Applicant: Peter Lewis
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis

(This is a revised project description: Proposal to demolish all existing buildings on the lot and construct a new, 20,426 square foot (net), 3-story mixed-use project. Buildings to be demolished include 1,682 square feet of commercial space and 6,189 square feet of residential space. New commercial floor area on the first floor will total 2,080 square feet, with a net gain of 398 square feet in the Minor Addition category. There will be 29 residential units on all three floors, with 1,439 square feet on the first floor, 9,129 square feet on the second floor, and 7,115 square feet on the third floor, for a total of 17,683 square feet of new residential floor area. A total of 37 parking spaces and 32 bike parking spaces will be provided on the ground floor. The maximum height of the building is 41 feet. Grading excavation of 20 cubic yards is also proposed. Under the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program (AUD), the proposed residential density is 61 dwelling units per acre, with a maximum of 63 units allowed on this 20,670 square foot parcel within the Priority Housing Overlay. The average unit size of the apartments is 610 square feet.)

(Project requires compliance with Tier 3 SWMP. Project was last reviewed November 24, 2014.)

Actual time: 3:43 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal and Jeff Hornbuckle, Architects; Jack Kiesel, Landscape Architect; and Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner.

Public comment opened at 4:08 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study the window and opening size/placement of the wall tall tower elements at the north elevation on Cota Street.
- 2) Study the center tower perforated crown element and return to a more traditional style detailing of the previous submittal.
- 3) Study the use and variety of balcony railing treatments and corrugation direction.
- 4) Study the break-ups of the Trespa material and sizes, and return to the previous submittal of the flat panel siding.
- 5) Study the colors closely and return with a more unified and harmonious color choice that works together. Provide a vignette or three dimensional samples of the balcony railings and perforated metal color samples that are galvanized or anodized for a matt or powder gray finish, not shiny.
- 6) Study introducing an opening to the west elevation of Salsipuedes Street to the parking area to give variety and depth to the wall.
- 7) Study the landscaping to be in concert with the building colors.

Action: Poole/Wittausch, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Cung absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**3. 600 BLK W ANAPAMU ST 1906 SEG ID****(4:15)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-906
 Application Number: MST2014-00386
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara

(Proposal to remove and replace the Anapamu Street Bridge over Old Mission Creek. The existing single span bridge is approximately 36 feet wide and 38 feet long and was constructed in 1926. A new single span bridge will be designed to meet the required standards of the City, Caltrans, and the American Association of State Highway and Transportation Officials (AASHTO).)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only: project requires Environmental Assessment. Project was last reviewed on September 2, 2014.)

Actual time: 4:39 p.m.

Present: John Ewasiuk, Public Works, Principal Civil Engineer; Craig Drake, Design Engineer; David Black, Landscape Architect; and Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner.

Public comment opened at 4:51 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the Applicant's improvements already made to the overall project.
- 2) The Board prefers a bridge style and guard rails similar to the other bridges in the City of Santa Barbara.
- 3) Study using colored concrete to warm up the aesthetic appearance of the project instead of the proposed grey color.
- 4) Study the underside of the bridge to create more of an arch.
- 5) Return with carefully considered lighting details, and return with trash cans and fencing details to surround the project.

Action: Tripp/Poole, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Cung absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**4. 350 HITCHCOCK WAY****E-3/PD/SD-2 Zone****(4:45)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-240-003
 Application Number: MST2015-00090
 Owner: DCH California Investments, LLC
 Applicant: SEPPS
 Architect: Robert Plant

(Proposal to demolish an existing approximately 15,000 square foot service bay structure and construct a new approximately 39,000 square foot, two-story automobile dealership building. The building will include three automobile showrooms totaling 12,500 square feet, business and automobile parts area totaling 5,500 square feet, enclosed service bays totaling 9,500 square feet, and interior car storage totaling 11,500 square feet. The project includes 168 parking spaces. The subject property is identified as Parcel 2 of a pending subdivision being reviewed under application MST2014-00166. Requires Planning Commission review for two Development Plans.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review. Project was last reviewed on July 20, 2015.)

Actual time: 5:07 p.m.

Present: Robert Plant, Flex Designs; Chuck McClure, Landscape Architect; Maruja Clensay, SEPPS; Mike Powell, New Century Automotive Group; and Dan Gullett, Project Planner.

Public comment opened at 5:18 p.m.

- 1) Joel Y. Orr, opposition; expressed concern regarding the large size of the proposed building for neighborhood compatibility.
- 2) Christine Fancher, opposition; expressed concern regarding the height and large amount of concrete and proposed square footage of the project (especially if the building is not occupied); not in favor of the proposed bicycle path instead of the existing pedestrian walking path.
- 3) Ginger Van Wagner, expressed opposition regarding possible un-maintained eucalyptus trees sitting atop the berm directly and potentially impacting adjacent homes.

Public comment closed at 5:25 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study increasing the landscaping in the front and along the north side entrance.
- 2) Study the porte-cochère on the south side of the building to bring it more in proportion with the posts on other side of the building.
- 3) Study changing planes between the first floor and second floor at the front of the building.
- 4) Assess the other elevations of the building to keep them industrial in appearance, yet still interesting.
- 5) Study the appropriateness of the Stenocarpus ("Fire Wheel tree"), at the parking lot finger planters.
- 6) Study adding mature palm trees to break the skyline of the canopy along the two-story porte-cochère.

Action: Wittausch/Hopkins, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Cung absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**5. 1200 BLK CLIFF DR**

(5:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-003-156
 Application Number: MST2015-00334
 Applicant: Verizon Wireless

(Proposal for a new wireless communications facility. The project includes a new antenna to be mounted on top of an existing utility pole located within the City right-of-way on the south side of Cliff Drive near Vista Pacifica. The antenna will increase the height of the utility pole from 28'-6" to 31'-0". Also proposed is a new equipment cabinet to be mounted on a concrete pad, new remote radio units and GPS mounted on a new H-frame, new hand hole, and co-axial cable. The area of work will be 3'-6" x 13'-0". A Public Works encroachment permit is being tracked separately under PBW2015-00514.)

(Requires No Visual Impact Findings and a Public Works Encroachment Permit. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 6:03 p.m.

Present: Sarah Sorensen and Yvonne Crawford, Agents for Verizon Wireless.

Public comment opened at 6:09 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board finds the two foot addition to the top of the pole is acceptable; however, the equipment at the base of pole needs study and better screening, whether with a wall or landscaping, with the equipment located further away from the sidewalk and public right-of-way.
- 2) Relocate the coaxial cable to the rear of the pole and out of the public view.
- 3) The exposed bollards are not acceptable.

Action: Poole/Miller, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Cung absent).

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 6:22 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 6:46 P.M. ***

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**6. 719 W SOLA ST****R-2 Zone**

(6:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-092-004
 Application Number: MST2014-00355
 Owner: Torres Living Trust
 Architect: Armando Arias Del Cid

(Proposal to demolish an existing 854 square foot 1-story dwelling unit, 431 square foot 2-car carport, and 70 square foot shed, and construct a new 3,121 square foot 2-story dwelling unit with an attached 444 square foot, 2-car garage. Also proposed is to construct a new 400 square foot, 2-car garage for the existing 1,287 square foot dwelling unit at the rear of the parcel, which will remain unchanged. New landscape and hardscape is also proposed.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on February 17, 2015.)

Actual time: 6:47 p.m.

Present: Duffy Smith, Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:53 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Full Board for Final Review with the comment to study more consistent detailing in the eaves.

Action: Poole/Wittausch, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Cung absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

7. 300 BLK GROVE LANE

(6:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-002-616
Application Number: MST2015-00381
Agent: Sequoia Deployment Services, Inc.

(Proposal for a new small cell wireless communications facility for Verizon including one 2'-0" diameter Cantenna and associated equipment to be mounted on top of an existing 25'-0" tall wooden utility pole. Also proposed is a new meter pedestal and pad with equipment cabinet and ground level handhole.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Requires No Visual Impact Findings and a Public Works Encroachment Permit.)

Actual time: 6:58 p.m.

Present: Paul V. Gerst, Agent for Verizon Wireless.

Public comment opened at 7:03 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Return with revised drawings showing the cabinet located to the south side of the pole.
- 2) Provide appropriate landscaping around the cabinet on both sides.
- 3) The Board finds the proposed cantenna and associated equipment acceptable as submitted.

Action: Wittausch/Poole, 4/1/0. Motion carried. (Hopkins opposed, Gradin/Cung absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

8. 400 BLK N CANADA ST

(6:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-007
Application Number: MST2015-00382
Agent: Sequoia Deployment Services, Inc.

(Proposal for a new small cell wireless communications facility for Verizon including one 2'-0" diameter Cantenna to be mounted on a new arm at 24'-0" off grade and associated equipment on an existing 36'-0" tall wooden utility pole. Also proposed is a new meter pedestal and pad with equipment cabinet and ground level handhole to be located around the corner on Blanchard Street.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Requires No Visual Impact Findings and a Public Works Encroachment Permit.)

Actual time: 7:21 p.m.

Present: Paul V. Gerst, Agent for Verizon Wireless.

Public comment opened at 7:26 p.m.

Lily and Craig McIntyre expressed concern regarding project impacts to future planned curb cut and parking at the vacant lot they own adjacent to the project site. Staff clarified that future curb cut and parking plans that are part of an adjacent existing lot should be reviewed and supported by Planning and Zoning, and advised the McIntyres to speak to staff at the Planning and Zoning Counter about their plans. The Applicant listened to the McIntyres' concerns and stated he was willing to work with them.

Public comment closed at 7:31 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study the location of the proposed ground equipment in the existing parkway of N. Canada Street for either the right or left of the proposed pole with antenna.
- 2) If the new location of the proposed ground equipment is in the curve or closer to the corner, and a new parkway is proposed, provide landscape planting and screening details at either location.

Action: Poole/Wittausch, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Cung absent).

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:43 P.M. ****