



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, April 13, 2015

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

KIRK GRADIN – CHAIR (Consent Agenda Representative)

SCOTT HOPKINS – VICE-CHAIR

THIEP CUNG

COURTNEY JANE MILLER (Consent Agenda Landscape Representative)

STEPHANIE POOLE (Consent Agenda Representative)

AMY FITZGERALD TRIPP

WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: JOHN CAMPANELLA

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): SHEILA LODGE

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Vice-Chair Hopkins.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Hopkins, Miller, Tripp, Wittausch, and Poole (present until 3:40 p.m.).

Members absent: Gradin and Cung.

Staff present: Gantz, Limón (present until 3:40 p.m.), and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **March 30, 2015**, as amended.

Action: Wittausch/Poole, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Cung absent).

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **April 6, 2015**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Kirk Gradin** and **Courtney Jane Miller**.

Action: Poole/Miller, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Cung absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **April 13, 2015**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Amy Fitzgerald-Tripp**.

Action: Poole/Wittausch, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Cung absent).

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.
- a. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:
- Chair Gradin and Board Member Cung will be absent, and Board Member Poole will leave at the conclusion of Item 1 at 915 E. Anapamu Street. Board Member Miller will be stepping down from Items 1 and 7 at 915 E. Anapamu Street and 110 S. Hope Avenue, respectively.
 - Due to lack of quorum, Agenda Item #7, 110 S. Hope Ave. – Building H was continued two weeks to the April 27, 2015 meeting.
 - There is an error in the project description for Item 4 at 1217 Punta Gorda Street. The new square footage on the agenda says 1,545 square feet but it should have said 798 square feet.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Request for two new *Ad-hoc* Subcommittees and appointment of Board members:

- 1) Citywide Wayfinding Signage Joint ABR/HLC *Ad-hoc* Subcommittee. Howard Wittausch was appointed, with Stephanie Poole appointed as an alternate. Teri Green, Associate Transportation Planner, provided the Board with information about this new *Ad-hoc* Subcommittee.
- 2) ABR Design Guidelines *Ad-hoc* Subcommittee. Amy Fitzgerald Tripp was appointed, with Stephanie Poole and Howard Wittausch appointed as an alternates.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

1. 915 E ANAPAMU ST

R-3 Zone

(3:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-201-003
 Application Number: MST2007-00331
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis
 Owner: Riviera Partners

(This is a revised project description. The original project received a Preliminary Approval on April 19, 2010 and consisted of 13 two-and three-story residential apartments totaling 23,850 square feet, and the demolition of an existing 2,192 square foot single-family residence on a 40,055 square foot parcel in the R-3 Zone. The proposal involved a total of 3,350 cubic yards of grading and 28 parking spaces (17 below grade and 11 at grade) and the removal of 20 existing trees, three trees to be relocated on site, 18 trees to remain, 35 new oak trees (seven on-site and 28 off-site), and 36 new ornamental trees. The proposed development has been revised to construction of a 24-unit apartment totaling 24,613 square feet. The project includes 16 studios, four, one-bedroom and four, two-bedroom apartments ranging from 527 to 1,253 square feet, with an average unit size of 659 square feet. The revised project consists primarily of changes to the interior floor plan and the exterior fenestration, and minimal changes to the building footprint for an increase of approximately 763 square feet.)

(Project Design Approval is requested for the revised project. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan. Project was last reviewed on March 30, 2015.)

Actual time: 2:23 p.m.

Vice-Chair Hopkins read a statement regarding sole proprietorships exceptions, and Board member presentations.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect; and Rogelio Solis, Cearnal Andrulaitis; and Courtney Jane Miller, Landscape Architect.

Staff present: Kelly Brodison, Assistant Planner; Gina Sunseri, Fire Inspector II; Steve Foley, Supervising Transportation Planner; and Chelsey Swanson, Associate Transportation Planner.

Public comment opened at 3:25 p.m.

- 1) Peggy Martens, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding widening the street on one side, visibility of parked cars, and requested a sidewalk extension and stone wall placement along Lowena Drive.
- 2) Ann Versola, (submitted previous email for 3/30/15 meeting) opposition; spoke of concerns regarding proper access to neighboring properties, traffic, and parking density.

Public comment closed at 3:28 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board found the proposed project acceptable.
- 2) One Board member suggested that the permeable material be extended to Lowena Drive and further refinement of the curb and ditch details at the driveway entrance.
- 3) The Vice Chair read the following CEQA finding into the record: "The ABR finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project."
- 4) The Compatibility Analysis criteria (SBMC 22.68.045) were met as follows:
 - a) The proposed project design is consistent with applicable ABR Design Guidelines, City Charter passages, and applicable Municipal Code provisions with regard to site design, architecture, and landscaping.
 - b) The project's design is consistent with the architectural character of the City and neighborhood.
 - c) The project's size, mass, bulk, size, height, and scale are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.
 - d) The project's design is appropriately sensitive to adjacent landmarks and historic resources, City structures of merit, sites, or established scenic public vistas.
 - e) The project's design provides an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.

Action: Wittausch/Poole, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller stepped down, Gradin/Cung absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW

2. 3714 STATE ST

C-P/SD-2 Zone

(3:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-300-023
 Application Number: MST2012-00443
 Owner: Kellogg Associates, LLC
 Applicant: Kenneth Marshall
 Architect: Brian Cearnal

(Revision to the previously approved mixed-use development at the former Sandman Inn site (MST2007-00591; City Council Resolution No. 10-020). The revised project involves the demolition of the existing, 52,815 square foot, 113-room hotel and restaurant, and construction of 5,110 square feet of office space and 72 residential condominiums.)

(Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 008-14. Project was last reviewed on December 9, 2013.)

Actual time: 3:40 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect; Kenneth Marshall, Applicant; and Susan Van Atta, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:55 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to In-Progress Review with strong positive comments:

- 1) A majority of the Board found the project acceptable, and the permeable paving and one-way driveway as enhancements. One Board member was in favor of a wider two-way driveway.
- 2) A majority of the Board is in favor of white as the predominant color for the project.
- 3) The Board found that the proposed landscaping and taller transplanted palm trees would help mitigate the east elevation plate height issue and add some variety to the architectural design.

Action: Wittausch/Tripp, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Cung/Poole absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

3. 3940 STATE ST

C-2/SD-2 Zone

(4:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 057-233-029
 Application Number: MST2015-00137
 Owner: Franchise Realty Interstate Corporation
 Architect: Pujo & Associates, Inc.
 Business Name: McDonald's

(Proposal to remove an existing playground structure and install a new playground structure in front of the existing McDonald's fast food restaurant. Also proposed is a 36" tall cable-railing to be installed on top of an existing 18" tall brick wall around the patio and play area. Staff Hearing Officer review of a zoning modification is requested for the structure to encroach into the required front setback.)

(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review.)

Actual time: 4:11 p.m.

Present: Alex Pujo, Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:14 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer to return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study replacing the black brick cap.
- 2) A majority of the Board thought the proposed railing design of the fence combined with the cable steel rail too eclectic compared with the rest of the materials on site. Restudy the proposed railing for an alternative design.
- 3) The Board found the requested zoning modification for the structure to encroach into the required front setback to be aesthetically appropriate, and found that the proposed modifications do not pose consistency issues with Architectural Board of Review Design Guidelines.

Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Cung/Poole absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**4. 1217 PUNTA GORDA ST****R-3 Zone****(4:30)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-293-014
 Application Number: MST2015-00031
 Owner: Gutierrez Family Trust
 Applicant: Windy Design Consultant

(Proposal to construct a new, 798 square foot 3-story dwelling unit at the rear of an existing 916 square foot 1-story dwelling unit, and to demolish an existing 370 square foot carport. A 655 square foot 4-car carport will comprise the ground floor of the new unit and will be attached to the existing unit. Also proposed on this approximately 5,000 square foot parcel is to legalize an as-built 4'-6" tall CMU wall topped with wrought iron railings, and to construct a new 5'-0" tall fence. There will be 1,468 square feet of permeable paving for the new driveway. An Administrative Exception is requested to allow an as-built over-height wall at the front property line. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for zoning modifications to encroach into the interior setback and for a reduction in the required open yard area.)

(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review.)

Actual time: 4:41 p.m.

Present: Patricio Nava, Applicant.

Public comment opened at 4:47 p.m.

- 1) Phil Walker, opposition; expressed concerns regarding proposed CMU wall and the creek setback for flood measures in that area.

An email of concern from Suzette Poulter was acknowledged. Also, Staff emailed the corrected square footage information and mentioned at the beginning of the meeting that the new square footage on the agenda says 1,545 square feet but should have said 798 square feet.

Public comment closed at 4:50 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the use of permeable paving.
- 2) Resolve the incompatibilities of the architectural style and design of the proposed project and unify the style to either Spanish or Craftsman. Study strengthening or thickening elements to improve the tenuous appearance and anchor the design of the structure to the site.
- 3) Restudy the transition of the third story to be more in scale with the first story of the building. Redesign the third story to be more set back from the front of the building. Minimize the third floor as much as possible.
- 4) Study ways to improve the column alignment.
- 5) Restudy the rear elevation and roof to incorporate more interesting elements.
- 6) Restudy the projecting wall elements and inconsistencies of the windows and door elements which are incompatible with the style and design of the project.

Action: Wittausch/Hopkins, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Cung/Poole absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**5. 220 N SOLEDAD ST****R-2 Zone**

(5:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-062-025
 Application Number: MST2015-00126
 Owner: Tom Gilles
 Architect: Don Swann

(Proposal to construct a new one- and two-story dwelling unit and a second story secondary dwelling unit on a 5,000 square foot vacant lot. Unit A, on the first and partial second floor, will have three bedrooms and will be 1,003 square feet. Unit B, on the second floor, will have one bedroom and will be 507 square feet. Three parking spaces will be provided in an attached 406 square foot two-car garage and one uncovered space. The proposal also includes 200 cubic feet of storage space for each unit and minor site walls and landscaping. Four trees are proposed to be removed: one 20' tall Pittosporum, one 20' tall Eugenia, one 25' tall Eugenia, and one 18' tall oak tree. The total proposed development on this parcel will be 2,019 square feet.)

(Comments only; Requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 5:16 p.m.

Present: Don Swann, Architect; and Tom Gilles, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:21 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study improving the architectural character by detailing railing, gutters, decorative lighting, fencing, eaves, rakes, door and windows details, a medium sand stucco finish, and decorative lighting.
- 2) Provide a landscape plan; study mitigating any tree removal with replacements.
- 3) Provide a color and materials board.
- 4) Provide Tier 2 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) requirements.
- 5) Provide driveway paving samples; study incorporating permeable paving.
- 6) Restudy improving the entry to the front unit to be more welcoming.
- 7) Study improving the fencing and yard entry orientation of the main living space to the indoor/outdoor relationship.

Action: Wittausch/Tripp, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Cung/Poole absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**6. 222 N SOLEDAD ST****R-2 Zone**

(5:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-062-024
 Application Number: MST2015-00127
 Owner: Tom Gilles
 Architect: Don Swann

(Proposal to construct a new one- and two-story dwelling unit and a second story secondary dwelling unit on a 5,000 square foot vacant lot. Unit A, on the first and partial second floor, will have three bedrooms and will be 1,003 square feet. Unit B, on the second floor, will have one bedroom and will be 507 square feet. Three parking spaces will be provided in an attached 406 square foot two-car garage and one uncovered space. The proposal also includes 200 cubic feet of storage space for each unit and minor site walls and landscaping. Nine trees will be removed: one 25' tall Pittosporum, one 18' tall Oak, five 30'-40' tall Tamarisks, and two 15' tall Tamarisks. The total proposed development on this parcel will be 2,019 square feet.)

(Comments only; Requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 5:36 p.m.

Present: Don Swann, Architect; and Tom Gilles, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:37 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study the north elevation of the rear unit for additional open space amenity opportunities.
- 2) Provide driveway paving samples and permeable paving underneath the large existing oak tree at the driveway.
- 3) Provide a landscape plan and City Arborist recommendations for oak tree removals.
- 4) Delineate a pedestrian path from the street along the driveway to access the rear units.
- 5) Change the projection of the kitchen roof pitch on the second story north elevation.
- 6) Study improving the architectural character by detailing railing, gutters, decorative lighting, fencing, eaves, rakes, door and windows details, a medium sand stucco finish, and decorative lighting.
- 7) Study moving the trash enclosure away from the walkway.
- 8) Provide a color and materials board.
- 9) Provide Tier 2 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) requirements.

Action: Miller/Hopkins, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Cung/Poole absent).

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 6:00 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 6:33 P.M. ***

FINAL REVIEW**7. 110 S HOPE AVE H****C-2/SD-2 Zone**

(6:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-010-014
 Application Number: MST2014-00581
 Owner: Macerich Company
 Architect: DMHA

(Proposal for a façade upgrade of Building "H", which is in accordance with the approved Tenant Design Criteria. This is part of Phase II of the master improvements for La Cumbre Plaza. The goal is to secure all permits and complete construction of all proposed work at La Cumbre Plaza by 2015. No square footage changes are proposed.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on March 16, 2015.)

Due to a loss of quorum, this item was postponed two weeks to April 27, 2015.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**8. 28 ANACAPA ST****OC/SD-3 Zone**

(6:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-113-009
 Application Number: MST2014-00635
 Owner: Hughes Land Holding Trust
 Architect: Sherry & Associates

(Proposal for alterations to an existing 3,695 square foot commercial building comprising the following: new partial stucco wall finish, new roof and parapet, new driveway arbor, new rooftop lantern, and door and window alterations. Also proposed on this approximately 10,000 square foot parcel is to replace an existing trellis with new, restripe the existing parking stalls, extend an existing deck, and add a new ramp. No new floor area is proposed.)

(Project Design and Final Approvals are requested for the remaining portion of the work including the arbor, façade changes, and trellis. The portion of the work comprising the deck extension, change to parking lot, and landscaping was granted Project Design and Final Approvals on February 17, 2015. Approval of a Coastal Exemption is required prior to building permit issuance.)

Actual time: 6:33 p.m.

Present: Dawn Sherry, Architect; and Mr. Kim Hughes, Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:49 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

FOR THE PROPOSED ARBOR, FAÇADE CHANGES, AND TRELIS PORTIONS:

Motion Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the condition that a Coastal Exemption be approved prior to building permit issuance.

Action: Wittausch/Miller, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin/Cung/Poole absent).

Board Comment: It was suggested that the Applicant provide an alternative to the decorative element of the steel inplate to enhance the appearance of the end of the bracket on the lantern.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:59 P.M. ****

CONSENT CALENDAR (1:00 P.M.)

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by **Amy Fitzgerald Tripp**.

ABR - FINAL REVIEW**A. 319 W ANAPAMU ST****R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-212-005
Application Number: MST2015-00015
Owner: Checkered Properties, LLC
Architect: Jyl Ratkevich

(Proposal to remove an unpermitted residential addition in an existing five-unit apartment complex. Unit C will be remodeled including new siding and 365 square foot roof. The proposal also includes demolition of 20 square feet at the rear within the required interior setback and a 20 square foot addition near the front entry. This project addresses violations identified in enforcement case ENF2014-01085.)

(Project was last reviewed on January 26, 2015.)

Present: Jyl Ratkevich, Applicant.

Final Approval as noted on plan Sheet A-2 with skylight detail to return to ABR Staff for approval.
Tripp, 1/0/0. Motion carried.

ABR - NEW ITEM**B. 1225 COAST VILLAGE RD****C-1/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 009-291-034
Application Number: MST2015-00159
Owner: Coast Village Investments, LP
Architect: Studio R Architecture & Design

(Proposal for exterior alterations to a commercial complex extending over four parcels and addresses including APNs 009-291-034, -035, -036, & -037 and 1225 & 1235 Coast Village Road and 1230 & 1236 Coast Village Circle. The work proposed is to repaint building exteriors, new window shutters, new wood corbels, and new light fixtures. No new floor area is proposed.)

Present: Rex Reskauff, Architect; and Trey Pinner, Owner.

Continued one week for complete plans showing light fixtures and corbel locations.
Tripp, 1/0/0. Motion carried.

**** CONSENT REVIEW ADJOURNED AT 1:25 P.M. ****