



# City of Santa Barbara Planning Division

## ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

**Monday, March 30, 2015**

**David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street**

**3:00 P.M.**

**BOARD MEMBERS:**

KIRK GRADIN – CHAIR (Consent Agenda Representative)

SCOTT HOPKINS – VICE-CHAIR

THIEP CUNG

COURTNEY JANE MILLER (Consent Agenda Landscape Representative)

STEPHANIE POOLE (Consent Agenda Representative)

AMY FITZGERALD TRIPP

WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:** DALE FRANCISCO

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:** JOHN CAMPANELLA

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate):** SHEILA LODGE

**STAFF:** JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor - Present  
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician - Absent  
KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

**Website: [www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov)**

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at [www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos](http://www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos).

**CALL TO ORDER:**

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Vice-Chair Hopkins.

**ATTENDANCE:**

Members present: Cung, Hopkins (present until 5:29 p.m.), Miller (present @ 5:08 p.m.), Poole, Tripp and Wittausch.  
Members absent: Gradin.  
Staff present: Limón and Goo.

**GENERAL BUSINESS:**

**A. Public Comment:**

No public comment.

**B. Approval of Minutes:**

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **March 16, 2015**, as amended.

Action: Wittausch/Poole, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Miller abstained, Gradin absent).

**C. Consent Calendars:**

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **March 23, 2015**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Poole** and **Miller**.

Action: Poole/Wittausch, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **March 30, 2015**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Poole** and **Miller**.

Action: Poole/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin absent).

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.
1. Mr. Limón made the following announcements:
    - a) Agenda Item 2, 32 Anacapa Street has been postponed indefinitely at the Applicant's request.
    - b) Chair Gradin will be absent from today's meeting, and therefore Vice-Chair Hopkins will chair the meeting.
    - c) Vice-Chair Hopkins will be stepping down from Agenda Item 5, 1818 Castillo Street, and Agenda Item 6, 3869 State Street, and Board Member Poole will therefore chair those two items.
    - d) Board Member Miller will be stepping down from Item 3 at 915 E. Anapamu Street.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

There were no reports.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**

**1. 312 RANCHERIA ST**

**R-4 Zone**

**(3:15)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-231-010  
 Application Number: MST2014-00567  
 Owner: Rancheria Cottages, LLC  
 Applicant: Acme Architecture

(Proposal to construct a new seven unit apartment complex on an 11,375 square foot vacant parcel. The project comprises two, 2-story buildings. Building 1 will be 2,433 square feet in size and will house three units and Building 2 will be 3,248 square feet in size and will house four units. Seven uncovered parking spaces and seven bicycle parking spaces are proposed, as well as new site utilities and a landscape plan. Two 20 foot tall pepper trees and one 20 foot tall palm tree will be removed. There will be 250 cubic yards of grading, which will be balanced on site. Under the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Incentive Program, the density of the proposed project is 27 dwelling units per acre with an average unit size of 812 square feet.)

**(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan. Project was last reviewed on December 8, 2014.)**

Actual time: 3:14 p.m.

Present: Keith Rivera, Architect; David Black, Landscape Architect; and Mark Jacobson, Partner/Co-Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:23 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

**Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Full Board for In-Progress Review for details with comments:**

- 1) Provide final drawings and details.
- 2) A majority of the Board found the project acceptable.
- 3) Provide a color board and a materials board; the Board encourages warmer colors and materials such as cedar wood to warm up the proposed project.
- 4) Restudy the awning on the flat hardie board panels and the railing at the corner element. Study replacing the metal material awning with cedar boards at the corner element.
- 5) Provide quality windows; and if possible, doors and windows are to be metal sash and frame.
- 6) Vice Chair Hopkins read the following finding into the record: "The ABR finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under

CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.”

Action: Wittausch/Poole, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin absent).

**\* THE FOLLOWING AGENDA ITEM HAS BEEN POSTPONED INDEFINITELY AT THE APPLICANT’S REQUEST. \***

## **PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**

### **2. 32 ANACAPA ST**

**OC/SD-3 Zone**

**(3:40)** Assessor’s Parcel Number: 033-113-012  
 Application Number: MST2013-00382  
 Owner: Jason Leggitt  
 Architect: SB Home Designs  
 Applicant: Misael Contreras

(Proposal to permit "as-built" uses in an existing 4,000 square foot commercial building including two new ADA accessible ramps, new deck areas totaling 1,006 square feet, door and window changes, and interior alterations for a restaurant/bar in Unit C. Currently there are ten legal nonconforming parking spaces on this approximately 12,000 square foot parcel with 10 parking spaces proposed. Also proposed is a new trash enclosure, new bicycle parking, and a new entry trellis connecting City Parking Lot 10 with this parcel. This project addresses violations identified in enforcement case ENF2013-00015 and requires Coastal Review.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Requires Coastal Review. Project was last reviewed on February 17, 2015.)**

**Postponed indefinitely at the Applicant’s request.**

**\* THE BOARD BRIEFLY RECESSED AT 3:44 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 4:00 P.M. \***

## **CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**

### **3. 915 E ANAPAMU ST**

**R-3 Zone**

**(4:10)** Assessor’s Parcel Number: 029-201-003  
 Application Number: MST2007-00331  
 Owner: Charles Crail  
 Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning & Permitting Services  
 Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis

(This is a revised project description. The original project received a Preliminary Approval on April 19, 2010 and consisted of 13 two-and three-story residential apartments totaling 23,850 square feet, and the demolition of an existing 2,192 square foot single-family residence on a 40,055 square foot parcel in the R-3 Zone. The proposal involved a total of 3,350 cubic yards of grading and 28 parking spaces (17 below grade and 11 at grade) and the removal of 20 existing trees, three trees to be relocated on site, 18 trees to remain, 35 new oak trees (seven on-site and 28 off-site), and 36 new ornamental trees. The proposed development has been revised to construction of a 24-unit apartment totaling 24,613 square feet. The project includes 16 studios, four, one-bedroom and four, two-bedroom apartments ranging from 527 to 1,253 square feet, with an average unit size of 659 square feet. The revised project consists primarily of changes to the interior floor plan and the exterior fenestration, and minimal changes to the building footprint for an increase of approximately 763 square feet.)

**(Concept Review is requested for a revised project. Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment for Environmental Review.)**

Actual time: 4:00 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect; and Rogelio Solis, Cearnal Andrulaitis; and Courtney Jane Miller, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:15 p.m.

- 1) Shirley Jansen (adjacent property owner); opposed; expressed concern regarding street access from Lowena, increased traffic congestion, and parking density. She felt that there has been inadequate preparation for future traffic congestion with the proposed project.
- 2) Robert Jones; opposed; expressed concern regarding parking spaces proposed, project density and lack of parking enforcement.
- 3) Anne D. Versola (submitted email, owns property across the street) opposed; expressed concern regarding parking and density concerns in the neighborhood area.
- 4) Mike Avila (property owner), expressed support for the proposed project.
- 5) Peggy Martens (adjacent property owner), opposed; expressed concern regarding traffic congestion and lack of parking.

An opposition email received from Anne D. Versola, and an opposition letter received from Stephen A. Raffetto regarding increased traffic and parking concerns in the neighborhood area were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:33 p.m.

**Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) Request that staff provide an updated traffic study including Transportation Division staff's assessment on guest parking and traffic circulation in the area of the project site.
- 2) A majority of the Board supports the proposed project and finds the architecture and landscape plan acceptable.
- 3) The Board had no issue with reducing or removing the frontage landscaping along Lowena Street in favor of providing improvements to the traffic circulation of the project area by slightly widening the street and would support providing more off-site parking; Applicant to study using improved paving materials.

Action: Wittausch/Poole, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller stepped down, Gradin absent).

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM****4. 1623 DE LA VINA ST****R-4 Zone**

**(4:40)** Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-171-010  
 Application Number: MST2014-00546  
 Owner: Sherrie McIver  
 Owner: Emmet Hawkes Jr.  
 Architect: Tom Ochsner  
 Applicant: Joseph Flynn

(Proposal to demolish a vacant 1,251 square foot, 2-story, single-family dwelling and 180 square foot detached garage and construct three new 2-story residential units. The new units are to be designed in the architectural style of the demolished building. Total development on site will be 2,618 square feet, with Unit A at 825 square feet, Unit B at 735 square feet, and Unit C at 805 square feet. Three uncovered parking spaces will be provided on this approximately 5,100 square foot parcel. Grading will be balanced on site. The density of the proposed project is Medium/High at 15-27 dwelling units per acre under the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Incentive Program, with an average unit size of 788 square feet.)

**(Second Concept Review. Project requires Conditions of Approval, compliance with Tier 2 Stormwater Management Program, and an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on November 24, 2014.)**

Actual time: 5:03 p.m.

Present: Tom Ochsner, Architect; Joseph Flynn, Applicant; and Emmet Hawkes Jr., Co-owner.

Public comment opened at 5:07 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

**Motion: Continued four weeks to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) The Board found the simple style and the general architecture acceptable.
- 2) Provide more traditional sliding glass doors. Study using the more attractive true or simulated divided lights.
- 3) Provide a color board.
- 4) For the bay windows at Units A and C, restudy the proportions and provide more of the craftsman style corbels, express rafters, and more details.
- 5) Study the size and proportion of the windows. Provide a more traditional window trim with details of stool and apron, with possibly a different size head.
- 6) Provide more enhanced details than the wrap-around siding on the base columns at the porch.
- 7) For Unit B (side yard), add taller landscaping or trees to add more interest to the elevation and screen the tall walls.
- 8) The private yard at Unit A needs permeable paving material in consideration of the adjacent oak tree, and provide details for treatment of the footings. Study using permeable materials for the all rear unit patio areas.
- 9) Provide the Biological Resource information on the plans.
- 10) Identify all existing trees on the site with details to be either kept or removed, and add tree protection measures from the Arborist Report to the plans.
- 11) Verify the decomposed granite is an acceptable material proposed for the driveway and locations.
- 12) Provide a prescribed path from the street to the rear units of possibly enhanced paving for way finding elements.
- 13) Restudy the trash enclosure rear location.

Action: Hopkins/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Gradin absent).

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****5. 1818 CASTILLO ST****R-4 Zone****(5:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-012-023

Application Number: MST2015-00092

Owner: DB Partners, LLC

Architect: Peikert + RRM Design Group

(Initial concept review of a proposal to demolish an existing single-family home, studio apartment, detached garage, two sheds, and construct a three-story residential apartment building under the Average Unit Size Density Incentive Program. The project will result in seven units comprising two, 2-bedroom units and five, 3-bedroom units, totaling 6,569 square feet. This 12,656 square foot parcel is designated as Medium High density with a maximum average density allowed of 945 square feet per unit. The average unit size for this project will be 938 square feet. There will be seven covered parking spaces provided on the ground floor of the building.)

**(One-time Concept Review; Comments only.)**

Actual time: 5:29 p.m.

Present: Detlev Peikert, Architect; and Gordon Brewer, RRM Design Group.

Public comment opened at 5:37 p.m.

- 1) Brian Barnwell, opposition; expressed concerns regarding neighborhood compatibility of the proposed project for the area.
- 2) Kip Bradley, opposition; expressed concerns regarding neighborhood compatibility.

Public comment closed at 5:40 p.m.

Public comment via email from Pamela Lasker and John Smith was acknowledged and addressed regarding neighborhood compatibility and parking density concerns for the area.

**Motion: Continued four weeks to Full Board with following general comments:**

- 1) A majority of the Board found the clean, simple, cottage design style and meandering path acceptable, charming, and compatible with the neighborhood.
- 2) Restudy the third story massing and number of units that seem incompatible with the cottage style of the architecture and the narrow size of the lot; consider relocating third story units to the rear of the property.
- 3) Restudy the plate heights.
- 4) Restudy the cantilevers and overhang dimensions into the driveways to be possibly relocated back.
- 5) Provide more useable landscaping and open space.
- 6) Restudy the neighborhood compatibility of the project scale; provide photographs of neighboring three-story buildings.

Action: Wittausch/Miller, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Hopkins stepped down, Gradin absent).

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM****6. 3869 STATE ST****C-2/SD-2 Zone****(5:25)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-022-037  
 Application Number: MST2013-00282  
 Owner: Housing Authority, City of Santa Barbara  
 Architect: Peikert + RRM Design Group

(Proposal to demolish an existing church and two-story building and construct an affordable senior rental housing development on a 45,195 square foot lot. The project consists of a new 44,029 square foot (gross), three-story residential building with 57 one-bedroom units, a manager's unit and 2,024 square feet of community space, administrative office, and laundry facilities. The project site is located in the Priority Housing Overlay; therefore, under the AUD program a maximum of 63 units per acre is allowed. The average unit size is 505 square feet (net). Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for a zoning modification to allow less than the required number of parking spaces.)

**(Second Concept Review. Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review. Project was last reviewed on July 22, 2013.)**

Actual time: 6:00 p.m.

Present: Detlev Peikert, Architect; Gordon Brewer, RRM Design Group; and Skip Szymanski, Housing Authority of Santa Barbara.

Public comment opened at 6:12 p.m.

1) Kip Bradley, opposition; expressed serious concerns regarding parking area impacts.

Public comment closed at 6:15 p.m.

**Motion: Continued indefinitely Staff Hearing Officer to return to Full Board with comments:**

- 1) Some Board members found the eastern façade monolithic; study splitting the façade or adding variety in forms and/or in colors to reduce monolithic appearance.
- 2) Study showing more variation of the roof line similar to the south elevation.
- 3) Provide larger scale drawings.
- 4) Provide some light into the corridors between buildings.
- 5) Restudy the middle parapet to be similar in style to the rest of the building.
- 6) Restudy the west elevation and show west side trees and details on the plans.
- 7) Provide community garden details and information.
- 8) Provide an additional landscape buffer on the east side between the parking lot and the site to provide a green oasis, provide tree shade to the building, and to mitigate the "sea of asphalt" appearance of the site.
- 9) Study incorporating permeable paving or alternative material.
- 10) Study minimizing the 6-foot walkway to delineate the parking stalls and incorporate more landscaping.
- 11) Study providing planters or angled parking spaces to provide more landscape buffer opportunities.

Action: Poole/Miller, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Hopkins stepped down, Gradin absent).

**\*\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:45 P.M. \*\***

**CONSENT CALENDAR (1:00 P.M.)**

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by **Stephanie Poole**, and **Courtney Jane Miller**.

**ABR - NEW ITEM****A. 331 W COTA ST****R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-152-032  
 Application Number: MST2015-00112  
 Owner: Castagnola Family Residual Trust  
 Architect: Thompson Naylor Architects, Inc.  
 Engineer: Mike Gones  
 Contractor: Campanelli Construction

(Proposal for a 248 square foot, one-story addition to Unit A at the front of an existing two-story, 3,556 square foot, four-unit complex on an 11,674 square foot parcel. The existing stone steps in the front stone wall would be relocated within the wall, and the wall restored. Also proposed is a 148 square foot deck with trellis at the street side elevation, replacement of the existing mailbox, gate, and fence, and new landscaping. Eight existing uncovered parking spaces will remain unchanged. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for a zoning modification to allow the addition to encroach into the required interior setback.)

**(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review.)**

Present: Suzette Naylor, Architect.

**Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer to return to Consent Review for Project Design Approval and Final Approval with comments:**

- 1) The proposed additions are compatible with the rest of the project with positive comments to the Staff Hearing Officer.
  - 2) Submit a Landscape Compliance sheet.
  - 3) Verify medium water use plant selection.
- Poole/Miller, 2/0/0. Motion carried.

**ABR - REVIEW AFTER FINAL****B. 530 W COTA ST****R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-102-024  
 Application Number: MST2011-00124  
 Owner: Terri Trevillian  
 Agent: Mark Morando

(Proposal to replace a 48 inch tall section of CMU wall along San Pascual Street, replace railroad ties with a CMU wall not to exceed 36 inches in height along Cota and San Pascual Streets and install a new 5 foot wood fence 14.5 feet in length at the northeast property line. The project will address violations in ENF2010-00315.)

**(Review After Final to change previously-approved material from CMU to Allan block.)**

Present: Mark Morando, Designer.

**Final Approval with conditions:**

- 1) Paint CMU wall to match Allan block wall.
- 2) Plant two 8-foot brown trunk Queen Palms to help screen the tall CMU wall.

- 3) Any disturbed plantings or landscaping shall be replaced in kind if wood timbers are removed from slopes.

Poole/Miller, 2/0/0. Motion carried.

**\*\* CONSENT REVIEW ADJOURNED AT 1:35 P.M. \*\***