



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

TUESDAY, January 20, 2015 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS:

KIRK GRADIN – CHAIR (Consent Agenda Representative)
SCOTT HOPKINS – VICE-CHAIR
THIEP CUNG
COURTNEY JANE MILLER (Consent Agenda Landscape Representative)
STEPHANIE POOLE (Consent Agenda Representative)
AMY FITZGERALD TRIPP
WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: JOHN CAMPANELLA
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): SHEILA LODGE

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:03 p.m. by Chair Gradin.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Gradin, Hopkins, Miller, Poole, Tripp and Wittausch.
Members absent: Cung.
Staff present: Gantz, Limón (present at 3:20 to 4:08 p.m.), and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **January 5, 2015**, as amended.

Action: Poole/Hopkins, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **January 12, 2015**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Stephanie Poole** and **Courtney Jane Miller**.

Action: Poole/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **Tuesday, January 20, 2015**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Stephanie Poole** and **Courtney Jane Miller**.

Action: Poole/Miller, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.
1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:
 - a) Board Member Cung will be absent from today's meeting, and Board Member Miller will step down from Item #1, 6100 Hollister Avenue.
 - b) The project at 2334 De La Vina Street, a three story, three unit condominium development, is scheduled to be reviewed by the Staff Hearing Officer on Wednesday, February 4th. The applicant will install story poles by Friday, January 30th, and requests ABR Board members to individually drive by the site to view the story poles installation.
- E. Subcommittee Reports.
- There were no reports.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

1. 6100 HOLLISTER AVE

(3:15)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 073-080-065
 Application Number: MST2015-00004
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara / Airport
 Architect: DeVicente Mills Holliday Associates

(Conceptual level review of a proposal to demolish an approximately 7,000 square foot building and construct eight new commercial/industrial buildings ranging in size from 5,500 to 8,900 square feet for a total of 54,500 square feet. A separate application is currently under review for another project on this parcel under application MST2014-00619 which includes the demolition of approximately 11 existing buildings and the construction of a new 125,000 square foot building. Planning Commission review is requested for a Development Plan.)

(Comments only; Requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review.)

Actual time: 3:15 p.m.

Present: Michael Holliday, Architect; and Hazel Johns, Santa Barbara Airport Director.

Public comment opened at 3:42 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board.

Action: Gradin/Poole, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Courtney Jane Miller stepped down, Cung absent).

Board comments:

- 1) Restudy breaking up the largely monolithic canopy as the frontage appears top-heavy; need more mass below than above. Provide more variety in building shapes along Hollister Avenue. Study changing the canopy dimensions as they wrap the corners, and reduce the number and frequency of supports to be less busy.
- 2) Provide a preliminary landscape plan.
- 3) Provide photovoltaic roof panel plans and details.
- 4) Study more cost-effective aesthetic alternatives to the proposed flat trellises.
- 5) Study incorporating green screens into usable shade.
- 6) More landscaping was suggested to soften and break up wall expanses.
- 7) Restudy the proposed grey color for more variation and depth to the building fenestration.
- 8) Study incorporating more natural light into the building.
- 9) Restudy modifying the building to properly address the street frontage along Hollister and break up the massing for more architectural interest. At the two-story heights, provide some second level intermittent openings to provide relief to the monotony. Study adding more interesting fenestration, articulation, and depth (possibly with step-ups to the building). Provide more variation in color.
- 10) Incorporate permeable paving into access driveways.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**2. 211 - 221 SYCAMORE LANE****R-2 Zone****(3:55)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-073-046
 Application Number: MST2014-00592
 Owner: Housing Authority/City of Santa Barbara
 Architect: DesignArc

(Proposal to renovate an existing 20-unit multi-family development on a 1.69 acre parcel. The proposal includes exterior improvements intended to give the buildings a "Spanish Colonial" architectural style, new patios, trash enclosure, fences, landscaping, raised entry stoops, and parking reconfiguration. There will be no new floor area. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for zoning modifications for minimum distance between buildings and front and interior setbacks. This application replaces expired master application MST2009-00482.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; Requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review. Project was last reviewed on December 22, 2014.)

Actual time: 4:08 p.m.

Due to conflict of interest, Board member Hopkins recused himself from the discussion on the project.

Present: Kevin Dumain, Architect; David Black, Landscape Architect; and Dale Aazam, Project Manager for the Housing Authority.

Public comment opened at 4:28 p.m.

- 1) Chris Dille (neighbor), opposition; expressed concerns regarding noise abatement screening, construction duration, and requested a more appropriate a more simple design architecture rather than the proposed "Spanish Colonial" architecture. She encouraged drive-by site visits by the Board.

Public comment closed at 4:32 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer to return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board found the overall project's direction is acceptable based on Board comments in the previous meeting. Further refinements requested are:
 - a. Study simplifying some of the details.
 - b. Restudy the distance of chimney bump-outs and buttresses.
 - c. Provide details for the terracotta vents at the gable ends.
 - d. Provide further architectural enhancements to announce the doorways.
 - e. Show entry doors as plank doors.
 - f. The Board finds the general plant palette acceptable; add fruit trees where possible.
 - g. Further study the existing creek plantings and their relationship with existing creek grass areas.
 - h. Provide lighting cut-sheet details, a color and materials boards, and any additional corbel and fenestration details.
 - i. The Board finds the proposed zoning modifications are aesthetically appropriate and do not pose consistency issues with the ABR Design Guidelines or the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance. The Board also finds the proposed zoning modifications present no negative impacts to the neighborhood.
 - j. Choose one style of architecture, either Monterey Colonial or Spanish Colonial Revival.

Action: Gradin/Wittausch, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Hopkins abstained, Cung absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**3. 926 INDIO MUERTO ST****C-2/SD-3 Zone****(4:15)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-284-003

Application Number: MST2014-00415

Owner: IWF SB Gateway, LP

Architect: Hochhauser Blatter Architecture & Planning

(Proposal to demolish an existing 12,000 square foot commercial building and construct an approximately 55,000 square foot, 45'-0" tall hotel on a 38,122 square foot parcel. The project will comprise a three-story hotel with 115-120 rooms and a 90 space, semi-subterranean parking lot with supportive amenities. Planning Commission review is requested for a Development Plan, a Coastal Development Permit, and a Transfer of Existing Development Rights.)

(Comments only; requires Environmental Review and Planning Commission Review.)

Actual time: 5:12 p.m.

Present: Jan Hochhauser; Architect; David Black, Landscape Architect; Matt Marquis, Representative for Pacifica Hotels, Inc. and Invest West Financial Corporation; and Kelly Brodison, Assistant Planner.

Public comment opened at 5:46 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) In general the Board found the proposed project to be an appropriate use of the site.
- 2) Study separating the combined vehicular and pedestrian entries for a more welcoming pedestrian entry.
- 3) Return with photograph examples of neighborhood buildings of similar scale and mass to assist in determining the neighborhood compatibility of the project's mass, bulk, and scale.
- 4) Resolve the unbroken fenestration along the 8-10 foot height of the base of the tower element for more openings and other use to offset the castle-like appearance.
- 5) Study the northeast corner to provide more refinement and architectural interest.
- 6) Restudy the fourth floor parapet line to be less monotonous and continuous by adding significant breaks and variety in the fourth floor massing.
- 7) Provide larger-scale elevations.
- 8) Study creating a more welcoming Indio Muerto pedestrian experience by adding more landscaping between the building and the sidewalk. Study adding more in-grade planters at the end of Indio Muerto Street.
- 9) Study the landscape corridor adjacent to the freeway. Provide photographs of views from the freeway, and add a dashed line to the plans showing the freeway.
- 10) Study adding trees to mitigate air pollution.

Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

**** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 6:16 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 6:41 P.M. ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**4. 801 CLIFF DRIVE****R-2/SD-3 Zone****(5:15)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-250-008
Application Number: MST2014-00586
Owner: Unknown Dream, LLC
Architect: On Design, LLC
Applicant: Susan Elledge Planning & Permitting Svcs. Inc. (SEPPS)
Applicant: James Cole
Landscape Architect: CMLA Landscape Architects

(Proposal to remodel a 97 unit apartment complex consisting of unpermitted improvements and proposed improvements on a 6.72 acre parcel. The unpermitted work includes the removal of 39 mature trees, exterior paint changes, metal building siding, metal window awnings, replacement of irrigation system and new landscaping, concrete pads for picnic and ping-pong tables, bocce ball court, security fencing and entrance gate, new fence and railings around swimming pool, parking lot reconfiguration restriping, painting, speed bumps, traffic control gate, EV charging stations, bike racks, and mailboxes. Proposed improvements include sidewalk widening along Cliff Drive, re-contouring the perimeter berm and erosion control, new street trees, new perimeter landscaping, new garage doors on five buildings, relocation of the MTD bus stop, additional restoration landscaping and tree mitigation planting, and 2,800 cubic yards of grading excavation. This project requires Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

Actual time: 6:41 p.m.

Present: Keith Nolan, Architect; Laurel Perez, SEPPS/Applicant (working with Steve Fort, Trish Allen, and James Cole); Chuck McClure, Landscape Architect; and Tony Boughman, Assistant Planner.

Public comment opened at 7:07 p.m.

- 1) Don Hartley, Santa Barbara City College, submitted written public slip comments in support of creek mitigation on the proposed project parcel and the City College parcel, which were read into the record by the Chair.
- 2) Julie Hendricks Fahnestock, Santa Barbara City College Senior Facilities Director, expressed support and indicated a mutual interest to partner with the Applicant for improvements of the adjacent West Campus oak woodland and riparian habitat and existing creek, and the formation of a habitat restoration plan and long term maintenance procedures.
- 3) Tom Oschner (neighbor), expressed general support of the proposed project.

An emailed letter of support from Julie Hendricks Fahnestock was received and acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 7:11 p.m.

Due to the complexity of the project, Ms. Miller stated for the record that she met with the Applicant and Staff to review the project plans prior to the meeting.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board finds the proposed glass railings are not appropriate in this location.
- 2) Provide details where color changes occur on the buildings.
- 3) Provide a photographic survey along the entire street frontages.
- 4) Provide elevation drawings that clearly indicate the proposed, existing, and as-built work, and provide additional details for architectural features already added or proposed.
- 5) Provide additional skyline trees in locations close to the buildings, which is not in a High Fire Hazard Area.
- 6) Provide larger specimen skyline trees at a minimum 24-inch box size adjacent to the buildings and along the public right-of-way.
- 7) Delineate the plant massing along the streetscape and understory in a more organic way rather than organized massing across the large expansive slope. Provide erosion-control netting where the slope has a 2:1 ratio.
- 8) Provide creek restoration planting details when available.
- 9) Study using only native plant material between the creek and the parking lot, as opposed to the stark transition between native and tropical plantings.
- 10) The Board strongly suggests long-term monitoring to ensure survival of the large oak specimens recently planted within the creek restoration area. Study replacing the large oak trees in the creek restoration area with smaller, more efficient plantings for better long-term monitoring and more tree canopy.
- 11) Study the transitions between building colors; restudy the brown of Building 821.
- 12) Show tree locations and plant call-outs for the creek restoration area on the plans.
- 13) Study the inclusion of the trails and interpretive signage within the creek area.

Action: Miller/Wittausch, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**5. 433 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA****R-2 Zone****(6:30)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-391-008
 Application Number: MST2014-00547
 Owner: Oliviera Trust, Barton Clemens, Trustee
 Applicant: Joseph Flynn
 Architect: Tom Ochsner, Architect

(Proposal to demolish a vacant 1-story, 800 square foot single-family dwelling and construct a new 2-story residential duplex on an approximately 6,100 square foot parcel located in the Hillside Design District. Unit A is proposed at 1,845 square feet including an attached 400 square foot 2-car garage, and Unit B is proposed at 2,024 square feet including an attached 400 square foot 2-car garage, for a total of 3,869 square feet of development. Three upper level decks totaling 213 square feet are also proposed. Grading will be balanced on site. One 5" Juniper tree is proposed to be removed, and two small Palm trees will either be removed or relocated.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 7:44 p.m.

Present: Joseph Flynn, Applicant; and Tom Ochsner, Architect.

Public comment opened at 7:59 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board finds acceptable the changes made to the Haley Street and Alameda Padre Serra elevations.
- 2) Show the elevations transitions between the wall and Haley Street, and the wall and Alameda Padre Serra, and how they step down.
- 3) Restudy the third floor deck to provide landscape screening to address privacy concerns of the neighbor's adjacent side yard.
- 4) Provide planting sizes on the plans.

Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Gradin abstained, Cung absent).

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**6. 725 OLIVE ST****R-3 Zone**

(7:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-092-018
 Application Number: MST2014-00112
 Owner: Louis Sanchez
 Designer: Edward Deras

(Proposal to add a 937 square foot second story single-family dwelling on an existing 942 square foot single-family dwelling with attached new 376 square foot two-car carport. An existing 908 square foot three-car garage will be demolished. Also proposed on this 5,300 square foot parcel is a 112 square foot deck on top of a portion of the new carport, two uncovered parking spaces, and minimal grading to be balanced on site. The maximum building height will be 29.5 feet and the total floor area will be 1,895 square feet. This project requires Staff Hearing Officer review of a zoning modification.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 063-14 and an Environmental Finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan. Project was last reviewed on June 23, 2014.)

Actual time: 8:11 p.m.

Present: Edward Deras, Designer; and Eileen Davis and Ms. Sanchez, Owners.

Public comment opened at 8:09 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide lighting, electrical, and structural plans, with architectural and preliminary framing details.
- 2) Provide a landscape plan details, lighting details, and a color and materials board.
- 3) Study adding an additional tree along the north elevation adjacent to the building.
- 4) Provide fence details.
- 5) Study including ADA compliance details.
- 6) Study providing a contiguous front walkway in the front; and suggest using permeable pavers at the front door.
- 7) Reconsider the use of stepping stones that may impede access.
- 8) Board member Wittausch read the following finding into the record: "The ABR finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.

Action: Wittausch/Poole, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:35 P.M. ****

CONSENT CALENDAR (1:00 P.M.)

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by **Stephanie Poole** and **Courtney Jane Miller**.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**A. 1085 COAST VILLAGE RD****C-1/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 009-281-003
 Application Number: MST2010-00026
 Architect: DesignArc
 Owner: Bob Uellner
 Owner: Janda Partners, LP

(Proposal for extensive exterior alterations to the existing service station including converting an existing lube bay and snack shop to a foodmart and constructing a new car wash structure. The project includes demolition of 344 square feet of the existing 2,317 square foot building on the south side to allow the addition of the car wash structure, the addition of 607 square feet of retail space on the north side for a total of 2,580 square feet of retail use. The unenclosed car wash "tunnel" structure is 1,667 square feet and 135 square feet for mechanical equipment, for a total combined development of 4,382 square feet on the 24,983 square foot site. A 510 square foot trellis will be located on the west side of the lot for car detailing. An existing driveway on Coast Village Road will be relocated further west. The existing gas pumps will remain. The Planning Commission approved an amendment to the Conditional Use Permit, a Coastal Development Permit, a zoning modification to allow an automated pay kiosk in the required front setback along Coast Village Circle, and a zoning modification to provide fewer than the required number of parking spaces.)

(Review After Final of the following changes: Change concrete driveway color from light gray to dark gray; replace portions of landscaping with permeable pavers; removal of a dead pine tree; planter changes; revised trellis design.)

Present: Kevin Dumain, Architect/DesignArc; and Bob Cunningham, Landscape Architect/Arcadia Studio; and Keith Slocum, Contactor.

Final Approval of Review After Final as noted on plan Sheets A1.01 and LP-1.
 Poole/Miller, 2/0/0.

NEW ITEM**B. 2623 DE LA VINA ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-292-001
 Application Number: MST2015-00007
 Owner: Santa Barbara County Fed Credit Union
 Architect: CM LA

(Proposal for a new landscape and irrigation plan. The project will comprise the removal of existing sod and installation of new drip irrigation and drought-tolerant plants. This application will address violations identified in enforcement case ENF2010-00124.)

Present: Chuck McClure, Landscape Architect.

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as noted on plan Sheet L-1.
 Miller/Poole, 2/0/0.

CONTINUED ITEM**C. 3712 STATE ST****C-P/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-300-027
Application Number: MST2014-00624
Owner: Automobile Club of Southern California
Engineer: Ulises Araujo

(Proposal for voluntary site accessibility upgrades for a lot developed with an existing 7,290 square foot commercial building. Site improvements include adding a 3'-0" tall wrought iron entry gate at the driveway, upgrading the site parking to add four (4) new accessible parking spaces and path of travel, and providing a new accessible ramp from the public right-of-way to the accessible building entry. There are 72 existing parking spaces with 72 to remain. Also proposed is a revised landscape plan including new drought-tolerant landscaping and trash enclosure. There will be no alterations to the existing building.)

(Action can be taken if sufficient information is provided; requires compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program.)

Postponed indefinitely at the Applicant's request.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**D. 415 E DE LA GUERRA ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-022-008
Application Number: MST2014-00502
Owner: Edith Ziliotto
Architect: James Zimmerman, AIA Architects

(Proposal to construct a new 180 square foot accessible trash enclosure located on a 14,831 square foot lot developed with an existing mixed-use development. The proposal will include the elimination of one parking space to meet accessibility requirements.)

(Review After Final of changes to approved trash enclosure design, miscellaneous paving changes to comply with ADA, replacement of a site wall with landscaping, and landscape screening of the backflow device.)

Present: Paul Sicat, Applicant.

Final Approval of Review After Final as noted on the plans.
Poole/Miller, 2/0/0.

NEW ITEM**E. 3432 RICHLAND DR****R-3/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-061-018
Application Number: MST2015-00013
Owner: Barbara Hastings Cox
Designer: Amy Von Protz

(Proposal for exterior alterations to an existing apartment building including two new 4'-11-3/4" tall storage units of 120 square feet each, exterior paint color change, re-striping existing parking lot, and new landscaping in the parking lot finger planters. No new floor area is proposed, and there will be no change in the number of parking spaces provided.)

Present: Amy Von Protz, Applicant; and Jason Sunukjian, Property Manager.

Continued indefinitely with comments:

- 1) Reconsider the proposed colors.
- 2) The site plan is to match the existing conditions on the photographs.
- 3) Return with improved photographs with views from the street.
- 4) Provide landscaping between the parking and the storage buildings.
- 5) Provide a drip irrigation system.
- 6) Adjust the storage building locations closer to the apartment buildings to increase the amount of landscaping.
- 7) Include the striping of the building.
- 8) Show wheel stops and the delineation of the curb cuts.

Poole/Miller, 2/0/0.

**** CONSENT REVIEW ADJOURNED AT 2:15 P.M. ****