



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, November 24, 2014 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS:

PAUL ZINK, *Chair*
KIRK GRADIN, *Vice-Chair* (Consent Calendar Representative)
THIEP CUNG
SCOTT HOPKINS
COURTNEY JANE MILLER (Landscape Representative)
STEPHANIE POOLE (Consent Calendar Representative)
WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): JOHN CAMPANELLA

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 SUZAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:02 p.m. by Chair Zink.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Zink, Cung (present at 3:05 p.m., until 6:06 p.m.), Gradin, Hopkins, Miller (present until 5:28 p.m.), Poole, and Wittausch.
Members absent: None.
Staff present: Gantz, Limón (present until 5: p.m.), and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **November 10, 2014**, as amended.

Action: Poole/Hopkins, 6/0/1. Motion carried. (Zink abstained, Cung absent).

C. Consent Calendars:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **November 17, 2014**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Kirk Gradin** and **Courtney Jane Miller**.

Action: Miller/Wittausch, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **November 24, 2014**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Kirk Gradin** and **Courtney Jane Miller**.

Action: Miller/Hopkins, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:

- a) Board Member Miller will leave today's meeting at 5:30 p.m.
- b) The consultant team for the New Zoning Ordinance (NZO) has been hired and the City encourages Board members and the public to stay informed. To receive updates of future meetings regarding the New Zoning Ordinance effort, please subscribe for Notifications of the New Zoning Ordinance at the website dedicated to this effort: www.santabarbaraca.gov/NZO under the "Get Involved" tab. The website now includes the Scope of Work, Schedule, and Public Outreach Program under "Reference Documents."

E. Subcommittee Reports: There were no reports.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

1. MINOR AMENDMENTS TO THE OUTDOOR LIGHTING AND STREETLIGHT DESIGN GUIDELINES

(3:15) Presenter: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner/Design Review Supervisor.

Board Comments:

- 1) Suggested Ordinance changes may be emailed from the Board to staff at a later time.
- 2) Staff clarified for the Board the holiday lighting exception incorporated into the Ordinance.
- 3) Staff clarified temporary festival string lighting on roof decks for special events and functions.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

2. 1298 LAS POSITAS RD

A-1 Zone

(3:25) Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-010-034
 Application Number: MST2013-00141
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Elings Park
 Architect: Ray Hicks

(Proposal for demolition of the existing 872 square foot office/restroom building at the tennis facility and construction of a new 3,507 square foot multiple-use building that includes a fitness room, cafe kitchen, pro shop, restrooms and office. The project also includes replacement of existing tennis stadium seating and repairs to the existing parking lot. Grading includes 220 cubic yards of cut and 22 cubic yards of fill. Planning Commission review is requested for 2,635 square feet of new non-residential square footage. Parks and Recreation Commission approval will be required for the project.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Planning Commission review. Project was last reviewed on December 9, 2013.)

Actual time: 3:22 p.m.

Present: Ray Hicks, Architect; Michael Ellison, Executive Director; Derek Westen, Applicant; Danny Vickers, Agent for Elings Park; and Allison De Busk, Project Planner.

Public comment opened at 3:43 p.m.

- 1) David Niles, (also Representative for Larry Praissman, Phillip Hill, Abe Mira) opposition; concerns regarding zoning, setbacks, square footage, and conceptual plan details of the proposed project; also requested the Board withhold comment at this time.
- 2) Karen Van Hoek, MD, (also Representative for Ed Taylor) opposition; spoke of toxic gas emission concerns within the public park.

3) David Boone, opposition; spoke of concerns regarding size of the project.

An email of support from Danuta McCall, and two opposition emails of concern from Patricia Foley and Larry Praissman were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:50 p.m.

Ms. De Busk clarified the Architectural Board of Review's aesthetics, and size, bulk, and scale purview of the project, and the need for the Board's conceptual comments before the proposed project continues the design review process.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Return with final design incorporated into the scale model.
- 2) Some Board members suggested expanding the curved roof and eliminating the canvas awnings on the two sides.
- 3) Study lowering the ceiling height of the exercise room to a more manageable scaled ceiling height (instead of the proposed 16-18 foot height).
- 4) Some Board members suggested a restudy of the building frontage facing the tennis courts into a series of buildings for a more interesting frontage.
- 5) The building material frontage can be of exposed block or concrete.
- 6) Provide an existing tree plan with details for all trees in the vicinity of the project.
- 7) Study the use of permeable paving where possible.
- 8) Provide an alternative native tree species to the proposed *Agonis flexuosa* Peppermint Tree.
- 9) Provide enhancements to the existing landscaped areas in the vicinity of the project.
- 10) Show all existing and proposed retaining walls with finish and height details.
- 11) Some Board members suggested simplifying the front façade facing the tennis courts.
- 12) Provide a parking plan with Transportation Planning review of the parking lot configuration and gate designs, including gate locations, turnaround, ingress and egress, number of parking spaces, etc.
- 13) Provide a landscape plan by a landscape architect.

Action: Cung/Miller, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**3. 604 E COTA ST****C-M Zone**

(4:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-222-001
Application Number: MST2014-00220
Owner: Hammer Properties, LLC
Applicant: Peter Lewis
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis

(This is a revised project description: Proposal to demolish all existing buildings on the lot and construct a new, 20,221 square foot (net), 3-story mixed-use project. Buildings to be demolished include 1,682 square feet of commercial space and 6,189 square feet of residential space. New commercial floor area on the first floor will total 1,996 square feet, with a net gain of 314 square feet in the Minor Addition category. There will be 29 residential units on all three floors, with 2,130 square feet on the first floor, 9,045 square feet on the second floor, and 7,050 square feet on the third floor, for a total of 18,225 square feet of new residential floor area. A total of 37 parking spaces and 32 bike parking spaces will be provided on the ground floor. The maximum height of the building is 41 feet. Grading excavation of 20 cubic yards is also proposed. Under the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program (AUD), the proposed residential density is 61 dwelling units per acre, with a maximum of 63 units allowed on this 20,670 square foot parcel within the Priority Housing Overlay. The average unit size of the apartments is 605 square feet.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan. Project was last reviewed October 13, 2014.)

Actual time: 4:38 p.m.

Present: Peter Lewis, Applicant; Brian Cearnal, Architect; and Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner.

Public comment opened at 4:47 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Full Board for an In-Progress Review with comments:

- 1) The environmental finding was made that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.
- 2) Study simplifying the projecting two story element of the east elevation to be one material instead of two.
- 3) Study the ground floor windows along Salsipuedes Street to provide more differentiation between the corner elements and the central elements.
- 4) A majority of the Board prefers the white elevation at the center.
- 5) There shall be no exposed metal caps at the plaster parapets.
- 6) Provide additional detail (artistry) to the steel trellis at Salsipuedes Street.
- 7) Provide recessed windows at the plaster walls.
- 8) The Board carried forward *previous comments* #4, #5, and #7, from the October 13, 2014 meeting:
 - #4) Reduce or eliminate the dimensional awning element at the third story on the Salsipuedes side at the central plaster façade.
 - #5) Return with a preliminary concept of the balconies and railing details.
 - #7) Return with a material board and a color board.

- 9) Provide additional details and articulation for the covered roof at the second floor deck.
- 10) The Compatibility Analysis criteria (SBMC 22.68.045) were generally met as follows:
 - a) The proposed project design is consistent with applicable ABR Design Guidelines, City Charter passages, and applicable Municipal Code provisions with regard to site design, architecture, and landscaping.
 - b) The project's design is consistent with the architectural character of the City and neighborhood.
 - c) The project's size, mass, bulk, height, and scale are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.
 - d) The project's design is appropriately sensitive to adjacent landmarks and historic resources, City structures of merit, sites, or established scenic public vistas.
 - e) The project's design provides an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.

Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

4. 2217 OAK PARK LN

R-3 Zone

(4:40)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-160-009
 Application Number: MST2014-00544
 Owner: Dawn Close Living Trust
 Architect: Native Son Design Studio

(Proposal to construct a new 665 square foot residential unit above a new 1,056 square foot garage/accessory building. The approximately 11,000 square foot parcel is currently developed with two existing one-story residential units (Unit 1 is 1,000 square feet and Unit 2 is 700 square feet) with the existing units to remain unaltered. The project will provide two parking spaces for each unit (three covered, three uncovered) for a total of six spaces. A 62 square foot exterior stair and 341 square foot upper level deck is also proposed. Total development on site will be 3,421 square feet. This project will address violations identified in enforcement case ENF2013-00959.)

(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 5:21 p.m.

Present: Chris Cantrell, Architect; Margie Grace, Applicant; and Dawn Close, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:28 p.m.

- 1) Alex Kemp, southerly neighbor (submitted letter) opposition; spoke of concerns regarding east elevation vertical wall.

A letter of concern from Alex and Danielle Kemp was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:30 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide canopy drip lines of the existing oak trees that are potentially impacted by the development.
- 2) Clarify and define the pedestrian pathway to the new unit.
- 3) Study opportunities to reduce paving and add landscaped areas along the driveway and/or adjacent to the proposed unit.
- 4) Study additional landscaping along the property lines to provide privacy screening for adjacent neighbors.
- 5) Provide some architectural enhancement or addition to the roof line at the second floor on the east elevation.
- 6) Restudy the horizontal gutter on the north elevation.
- 7) Study providing edge of permeable paving.

Action: Gradin/Wittausch, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**5. 1623 DE LA VINA ST****R-4 Zone**

(5:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-171-010
 Application Number: MST2014-00546
 Owner: Sherrie McIver
 Owner: Emmet Hawkes, Jr.
 Architect: Tom Ochsner
 Applicant: Joseph Flynn

(Initial Concept Review of a proposal to demolish a vacant 1,251 square foot, 2-story, single-family dwelling and 180 square foot detached garage and construct three new 2-story residential units. The new units are to be designed in the architectural style of the demolished building. Total development on site will be 2,618 square feet, with Unit A at 870 square feet, Unit B at 900 square feet, and Unit C at 848 square feet. Three uncovered parking spaces will be provided on this approximately 5,100 square foot parcel. Grading will be balanced on site. The density of the proposed project is Medium/High at 15-27 dwelling units per acre under the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Incentive Program, with an average unit size of 872 square feet.)

(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 5:49 p.m.

Present: Tom Ochsner, Architect; and Emmet Hawkes, Jr., Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:13 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board found the proposed project is acceptable, and an appropriate example of the Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Incentive Program.
- 2) Resolve all environmental assessment issues.
- 3) Provide a path of travel to the rear units.
- 4) Provide a conceptual landscape plan, and the conceptual Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) requirements.
- 5) Provide a site plan with the adjacent footprints shown.
- 6) Some Board members had concerns regarding the third story appearance at the De La Vina Street location; study alternative attic/eave solutions.
- 7) Study enlarging the entry porch at Unit C.
- 8) Study increasing the space between Units B and C.

Action: Gradin/Wittausch, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller absent).

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 6:06 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 6:31 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

6. 1120 & 1122 INDIO MUERTO ST

R-3 Zone

(6:20)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-291-027
 Application Number: MST2014-00051
 Owner: Edward St George Revocable Trust
 Architect: On Design Architects

(This is a revised project description. Proposal to construct five new 2-story and 3-story buildings for a total of 11 new residential units on two separate parcels: Lot 2: This 7,290 square foot parcel at 1120 Indio Muerto (APN 017-291-004) will be developed with two, 2-story buildings: Building B, a duplex with attached 1-car garage, and Building C, a 3-car garage with a second-story dwelling unit. Four covered and two uncovered parking spaces are proposed. Lot 3: This 34,189 square foot parcel at 1122 Indio Muerto (017-291-027) will be developed with three, 3-story duplexes and one 2nd-story duplex above an existing 12-car garage. These buildings D, E, F, and G, will range in size from 2,500 - 3,000 square feet. An existing duplex, concrete driveway, and storage shed will be demolished. Over both parcels, 46 trees are proposed to be removed, with 23 of them being non-native and located within the creek setback. Trees to be removed include five Mexican fan palms ranging from 24" to 36" in diameter, one Brazilian pepper at 6" diameter, five Avocados from 8" to 24" diameter, 13 Tipuana ranging from 8" to 18" diameter, three Redwoods from 8" to 14" diameter, three Queen palms at 14" diameter, one Fruit at 6" diameter, two Myoporum at 8" & 10" diameter, three Eugenia ranging from 8" to 10" diameter, one Olive at 30" diameter, six Pittosporum ranging from 10" to 14" diameter, and three Grevillea Robusta at 24" diameter. Grading will be balanced on site with 2,210 cubic yards of excavation and 2,210 cubic yards of fill. This project will address violations identified in enforcement case ENF2014-00343.)

(Second Concept Review. Comments only: requires Environmental Assessment. Project was last reviewed on September 29, 2014.)

Actual time: 6:31 p.m.

Present: Keith Nolan and Laura Weinstein, Architects; and Chuck McClure, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:40 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the concept, placement, and mass, bulk and scale of the proposed project.
- 2) Study opportunities to reduce paving and increase landscaping.
- 3) Study opportunities to increase the canopy trees along driveway and parking areas to provide shade and break up the views of the buildings.
- 4) Study existing trees to preserve privacy along the creek bed important to adjacent neighbors. Study increasing privacy screening on all sides of the project.
- 5) Identify tree species details. Study increasing the landscaping and/or provide additional or relocating existing shade trees.
- 6) Study ways to relocate the parking away from Unit E or meander the proposed pedestrian path.
- 7) Study ways to add an additional parking stall.

Action: Gradin/Poole, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller/Cung absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**7. 215 PESETAS LN****C-2/SD-2 Zone****(7:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 057-203-003
Application Number: MST2014-00543
Owner: Sansum Clinic
Applicant: Sansum Clinic
Architect: Boulder Associates
Business Name: Sansum Clinic

(Initial concept review of a proposal for a minor ground floor addition of 164 square feet and exterior alterations to an existing 61,445 square foot, 3-story medical clinic. The project includes relocating the main entrance from the south side of the building to the north and adding a new canopy, adding an accessible entry at the northwest corner of the building and a new entry on the south side of the building. Also proposed is to relocate an existing MRI trailer to the west side of the property, add additional ADA parking spaces, and revise the landscaping.)

(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 7:00 p.m.

Present: Lance Ray, Architect; Brad Hess and Chris McNamera, Sansum Clinic; Dan Michealsen, Michealsen Construction Co., Inc.; and Martha Degasis, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 7:07 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Restudy the materials and the design of the entry canopies.
- 2) Restudy smoothing out the turning radius of the vehicular entrance to allow for more landscaping in the entry area.

Action: Wittausch/Poole, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Miller/Cung absent).

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:38 P.M. ****

CONSENT AGENDA (1:00 P.M.)

Items on Consent Agenda were reviewed by **Kirk Gradin** and **Courtney Jane Miller**.

ABR - NEW ITEM - PUBLIC HEARING**A. 2100 BLK BATH ST 1038 SEG ID**

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-038
 Application Number: MST2014-00553
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara, Public Works
 Applicant: Verizon Wireless
 Designer: V-One Design Group

(Proposal for a new Microcell wireless antenna to be located on an existing utility pole in the public right-of-way. Associated equipment will be located in ground-mounted metal cabinet adjacent to the utility pole, and connecting conduit will be underground.)

(Requires approval by Public Works.)

Present: Brooks Conley and Russell Story, Applicants.

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with conditions:

- 1) The ground-mounted Charles cabinet is to be painted a Malaga Green color.
- 2) All pole-mounted features shall be painted to match the pole.
- 3) The antenna mounted on the pole shall be either flush-mounted or mounted a minimum distance from the pole.

ABR - NEW ITEM**B. 310 E HALEY ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-281-003
 Application Number: MST2014-00571
 Owner: David Back Revocable Trust
 Applicant: Sherry & Associates

(Proposal for minor alterations to an existing commercial building including new doors and windows and a change to the existing archway at the Haley Street elevation.)

Present: Lauren Deason, Applicant.

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with conditions:

- 1) The existing plaster architecture on the north elevation shall remain.
- 2) The storefront system color shall be selected from El Pueblo Viejo (EPV) standard colors for the doors and windows.

ABR - NEW ITEM**C. 340 CONSUELO DR****R-2/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 059-211-012
Application Number: MST2014-00560
Owner: Elaine Abercrombie
Architect: Bildsten Architecture & Planning

(Proposal to permit the "as-built" enclosure of an existing 333 square foot screened rear porch with glazing and to remove a 66 square foot "as-built" shed from the interior and rear setbacks of an existing duplex. Also proposed is to construct a new exterior wall within the building footprint to add a new 46.5 square foot closet and to add washer and dryer hookups at the rear of each garage. This project will result in a residential addition of 379.5 square feet and will address violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2014-00389.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption - Projects Consistent with the General Plan. Project requires waivers of Parking Design Standards for both garages.)

Present: Ellen Bildsten, Applicant.

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding made for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption.

ABR - PROJECT DESIGN AND FINAL REVIEW**D. 327 N MILPAS ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-363-029
Application Number: MST2014-00530
Owner: Matilija Investment Property, LLC
Architect: Larry Graves

(Proposal to legalize an as-built commercial storefront remodel including façade, doors, windows, and awnings. There will be no change in the building footprint.)

Present: Larry Graves, Applicant.

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as noted on plan Sheet A-4.

ABR - CONTINUED ITEM**E. 219 MEIGS RD****R-2/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-011-012
Application Number: MST2014-00559
Owner: Housing Authority/City of Santa Barbara
Architect: Tom Moore Architect, AIA

(Proposal for alterations to an existing multi-family residential complex to include replacing all existing aluminum windows with new vinyl retrofit windows of the same size, and resealing the existing asphalt driveway. The parking configuration will be revised to provide two ADA-accessible parking spaces. There are currently 36 parking spaces with 35 proposed, with one parking space to be removed to create the accessible spaces. The existing carports will be reroofed, and one carport will be altered to eliminate a covered parking space to accommodate an accessible space. There will be 40 square feet of new concrete walkways and ramps.)

(Second Review.)

Present: Hector Torres, Applicant.

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the condition to provide a bronze color sample chip to ABR staff.

ABR - FINAL REVIEW**F. 1930 BATH ST****R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-361-001
Application Number: MST2014-00413
Owner: David Salaun
Designer: The Studio of David R Watkins

(Proposal to construct a 308 square foot, attached two-car garage addition to an existing one-story duplex located on a 6,652 square foot parcel. The proposal also includes an as-built 78 square foot addition and alterations to Unit "A" at 1934 Bath Street including demolition of approximately 23 square feet of existing deck area and replacing one entry door and window with a pair of French doors. New exterior paint colors are proposed for the entire duplex. The new garage will be located in approximately the same location as the originally-permitted garage, which was demolished without a permit.)

(Final Approval of architectural details is requested.)

Continued one week to Consent Review.

**** CONSENT REVIEW ADJOURNED AT 2:10 P.M. ****