



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, September 15, 2014 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS:

PAUL ZINK, *Chair*
KIRK GRADIN *Vice-Chair* (Consent Calendar Representative)
THIEP CUNG
SCOTT HOPKINS
COURTNEY JANE MILLER (Landscape Representative)
STEPHANIE POOLE (Consent Calendar Representative)
WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): JOHN CAMPANELLA

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:02 p.m. by Chair Zink.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Zink, Gradin, Hopkins, Miller, Poole (present at 3:58 p.m.), and Wittausch.
Members absent: Cung.
Staff present: Gantz, Limón, and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: To table the approval of the minutes of Tuesday, September 2, 2014, to later in the meeting.
Action: Gradin/Miller, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Poole abstained, Poole/Cung absent).

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **Tuesday, September 2, 2014**, as amended.

Action: Hopkins/Gradin, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Poole abstained, Poole/Cung absent).

C. Consent Minutes:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **September 8, 2014**. The Consent Minutes were reviewed by **Stephanie Poole/Philip Suding** (HLC member) for landscaping on Item A.

Action: Hopkins/Gradin, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Wittausch abstained, Poole/Cung absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Minutes of **September 15, 2014**. The Consent Minutes were reviewed by **Stephanie Poole/Courtney Jane Miller**.

Action: Wittausch/Miller, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Wittausch abstained, Poole/Cung absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

- 1) Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:
 - a) Board Member Hopkins will step down from Item 7 at 121 E. Mason Street due to conflict of interest;
 - b) Board Member Cung will be absent from the meeting; and
 - c) Board Member Poole will be approximately an hour late to the meeting.
- 2) Mr. Limón reported on some issues discussed at the Joint City Council and Planning Commission meeting held on September 11, 2014, with requests that the Community Development Director, George Buell, and the yet-to-be-appointed Building Official, review and improve inspections for compliance with approved design review plans to ensure buildings are built per plan. Further issues of concern were regarding improving compatibility analysis for multi-family projects with the Multi-family Design Guidelines. An approach and work program to address these issues will be addressed with the Board at a future date.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

Chair Zink and Member Hopkins reported that proposed Southern California Gas Company advanced meters around the City will soon return to the Board with updated plans.

PRESENTATION ITEM

1. AIASB ARCHITECTOURS 2014

(3:15) Presenter: Chris Mason-Hing, President, American Institute of Architects (AIA)/Santa Barbara.

(AIASB ArchitecTours 2014: This annual public tour highlights the latest in Santa Barbara design by members of the American Institute of Architects Santa Barbara Chapter (AIASB). The theme this year is “Sustainable Living” and focuses on sustainability, re-use, environmental compatibility, and energy economy. A tour of eight projects ranging from new and remodeled houses, multi-family residences, and forward-thinking commercial/institutional designs. The tour will be followed by a festive after-party hosted by Hayward’s Design Center).

Actual time: 3:12 p.m.

Presentation made and discussion held.

Board Comment: The Board looks forward to the annual public AIASB ArchitecTours this year!

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FOR 3 MINUTES AT 3:19 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 3:22 P.M. ***

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**2. 633 BATH ST****P-R Zone**

(3:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-113-009
 Application Number: MST2014-00267
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Jill Zachary, Assistant Parks & Recreation Director
 Applicant: Keven Strasburg, Park Project Technician

(Proposal for a new public pocket park on two combined vacant lots totaling 2,562 square feet located at the corner of Bath and E. Ortega Streets. The project comprises a new landscape plan with a children's playground structure, lighting, benches, and a 154 square foot permeable paved surface. There will be two ornamental iron fences: one at 115 lineal feet and 3'-0" tall, the other at 100 lineal feet and 6'-0" tall. Grading excavation of 25 cubic yards will be balanced on site. Staff Hearing Officer review of a zoning modification is requested.)

(Requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 041-14. Project was last reviewed on June 23, 2014.)

Actual time: 3:22 p.m.

Present: Jill Zachary, Assistant Parks & Recreation Director; and Keven Strasburg, Park Project Technician.

Public comment opened at 3:29 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the comment for the Applicant to provide a material and color board to Staff.

Action: Miller/Wittausch, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Poole/Cung absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**3. 2981 CLIFF DR****COUNTY Zone**

(4:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-092-013
 Application Number: MST2013-00445
 Owner: County of Santa Barbara
 Architect: Jeffrey Stoutenborough

(The project consists of a new 664 square foot (net)/ 786 square foot (gross) restroom facility at Arroyo Burro Beach County Park, a 7.17 acre regional beach/ park located at 2981 Cliff Drive. The existing 325 square foot men's restroom attached to the restaurant would be converted to storage. The existing 336 square foot detached women's bathroom would be converted to another use such as storage or other beach visitor supporting functions (e.g., paddle board, kayak, or beach chair rentals). The existing 201 square foot storage structure would be removed and replaced with new bicycle racks. The existing delivery aisle would be relocated and one vehicular parking space would be removed. The project would include approximately 60 cubic yards of cut and 35 cubic yards of fill. The discretionary application required for this project is a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 016-14. Project was last reviewed on May 12, 2014.)

Actual time: 3:49 p.m.

Present: Robert Ooley, County Architect; and Jill Van Wie, Capital Projects Manager of the Parks Division of the County of Santa Barbara; and Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner.

Ms. Kennedy reported that the proposed project's Coastal Development Permit was approved by the Planning Commission with a 7/0 vote at the July 10, 2014, hearing. Ms. Kennedy also clarified additional Commissioner's comments that were not included in the minutes of that hearing, which included that two of the seven Commissioners had issues with the site plan, the Commission's suggestion to relocate the shower and foot wash, and the overall comment to improve the compatibility of the structures through some architectural design or colors.

Public comment opened at 3:57 p.m.

Mr. Mike Jordan made comments in support of the proposed project.

Public comment closed at 4:00 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board members could say the project is ready for Project Design Approval? 4/2 (4 approved/2 abstained; vote passed).

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued one week to Consent Review with comments:

- 1) The proposed grass species of Mexican feather grass shall be replaced with an alternative native species.
- 2) The proposed colored concrete shall be noted on the plans, with the proposed color noted on the color board.
- 3) The split-face block shall be only one of the three proposed colors on the color board and noted on the plans.
- 4) The skylight fixtures should be flat and not bubbled.
- 5) Provide a large format or diagonal score pattern in some decorative pattern for the driveway area to be shown and noted on the site plan.
- 6) Show the irrigation backflow device details on the plans and provide screening from public view.

Action: Poole/Wittausch, 4/0/2. Motion carried. (Gradin/Wittausch abstained, Cung absent)

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE BOARD BRIEFLY RECESSED AT 4:35 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 4:41 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**4. 300 BLK S TO 900 BLK N MILPAS**

(4:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-387
Application Number: MST2014-00423
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Milpas Community Association

(Proposal for the temporary display of youth-generated art on trash cans along Milpas Street. Artwork in the "Yes We Can" art project would comprise high-resolution photographs printed on vinyl or pliable Plexiglas banners which would be wrapped around the trash cans and attached with Velcro and grommets. There will be no commercial messaging on the art pieces.)

(Concept Reviewed by the Visual Arts in Public Places Committee on June 19, 2014.)

Actual time: 4:41 p.m.

Present: Sharon Byrne, Applicant.

Public comment opened at 4:50 p.m.

- 1) Ginny Bush, Bea Molina, and Jarrett Gorin, Visual Arts in Public Places Committee members; expressed support for the proposed project.

Public comment closed at 4:54 p.m.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval for a three-year time period with comments:

- 1) After a three-year approval time period, the Board would like to see the project return for further rotation review.
- 2) All artwork shall be monitored for vandalism prevention and replaced as required if artwork degrades over time.
- 3) The Board stipulated that selected artists not use white backgrounds, but begin with multi-colored backgrounds within a specific range of colors, with more graphics and less text.
- 4) The finished edge of the artwork should terminate at least 6-inches above the surrounding ground surface for safer long-term maintenance.
- 5) All artwork shall be designed to fit the appropriate cans they were designed to fit, and displayed with more Velcro and grommet fastenings.

Action: Gradin/Poole, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**5. 719 W SOLA ST****R-2 Zone****(5:15)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-092-004
Application Number: MST2014-00355
Owner: Torres Living Trust
Architect: Armando Arias Del Cid

(Proposal to demolish an existing 854 square foot 1-story dwelling unit, 431 square foot 2-car carport, and 70 square foot shed, and construct a new 3,121 square foot 2-story dwelling unit with an attached 444 square foot, 2-car garage. Also proposed is to construct a new 185 square foot, 1-car carport and one uncovered parking space for the existing 1,287 square foot dwelling unit at the rear of the parcel, which will remain unchanged. New landscape and hardscape is also proposed.)

(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 5:09 p.m.

Present: Armando Arias Del Cid, Architect; Duffy Smith, Associate; and Wendy Glomb, Landscape Designer.

Public comment opened at 5:20 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide building footprints of adjacent buildings on both east and west elevations to understand and properly assess any impacts to adjacent neighbors.
- 2) The Board appreciates the overall project concept and finds the proposed size, mass, and scale appropriate to the neighborhood; however, Applicant to provide additional architectural details (traditional Spanish), and locations and photographs of other two-story structures and houses in the neighborhood.
- 3) Restudy the street-facing north elevation to provide more balanced massing and character facing the street.
- 4) Suggest a modulation of the roof line, and variation in the fenestration.
- 5) Study the privacy device and screen at the second floor deck.
- 6) Restudy the rear carport design to reduce the height and impact to the rear house and adjacent neighbors.
- 7) Study more traditional detailing at the master bedroom balcony.
- 8) Provide compliance with Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) requirements.
- 9) The Board recommends that an arborist make recommendations as to the foundation details near the Tipuana tree or propose to remove it.

Action: Gradin/Poole, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

Board comment: The Board suggested the Applicant add a canopy and consider adding small upper floor closet windows for additional character if it doesn't compromise privacy for adjacent neighbors.

FINAL REVIEW**6. 3885 STATE ST****C-2/SD-2 Zone****(6:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-022-012
 Application Number: MST2013-00411
 Architect: DesignArc
 Applicant: Greg Reitz
 Applicant: John Cuykendall
 Owner: State Street Property, LLC

(The proposed project consists of demolition of the existing 4,990 square foot motel at 3885 State Street and the 22,250 square foot existing two-story office/commercial building at 3887 State Street; and construction of a new four-story building with 4,469 square feet of new commercial office and retail space; 89 new apartment units with an average unit size of 804 square feet; and a new partially-subterranean 44,691 square foot parking garage with 134 parking spaces. The building would be approximately 136,077 square feet in area (including parking garage) and 45 feet tall. The project proposes a density of 63 dwelling units per acre, as allowed in the Average Unit-Size Density Incentive Program (AUD) Priority Housing Overlay. The project also includes 13 surface commercial parking spaces, 92 bicycle parking spaces, a swimming pool, roof deck, landscaping, grading consisting of 15,094 cubic yards of cut, and merger of the two existing parcels.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on September 2, 2014.)

Actual time: 5:58 p.m.

Present: John Cuykendall, Applicant; Ann Kale, Architectural Lighting Design; and Dan Gullett, Project Planner.

Public comment opened at 6:29 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Final Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent Review for details with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates all changes that have been made by the Applicant on the proposed project.
- 2) All 15 gallon trees on the south elevation and within the courtyard shall be up-sized to a minimum of 24-inch box size, and all 24-inch box trees shall be up-sized to 36-inch box size.
- 3) Provide all planting details.
- 4) Provide an irrigation plan with backflow and fire prevention valves.
- 5) Provide vine wall details and stone masonry detailing of the wall on the State Street side.

Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Cung absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**7. 121 E MASON ST****OC/SD-3 Zone**

(6:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-084-005
Application Number: MST2014-00375
Owner: Sri Padma, LLC
Owner: Somo SB, LLC
Architect: Dan Weber
Applicant: Mesa Lane Partners

(Proposal for the installation of 13 modified shipping containers to be used for arts-related uses, and a modified Airstream trailer to be used for food service. The proposal includes new overhead site lighting, approximately 791 square feet of landscaped area, portable restroom facilities, and reconfiguration of an existing parking lot to accommodate seven additional parking spaces with tandem parking. Total non-residential building floor area on the site would be 2,994 square feet. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested for a Coastal Development Permit and Development Plan. The project is proposed as a temporary installation until construction commences for the large site redevelopment proposal previously reviewed by the Architectural Board of Review under application MST2014-00115.)

(Comments only; requires Environmental Assessment, Coastal Review, and Staff Hearing Officer review.)

Actual time: 6:50 p.m.

Present: Tony Tomasello, Applicant; Dan Weber, Architect; and Dan Gullett, Project Planner.

Public comment opened at 7:08 p.m.

The following speakers spoke in support of the proposed project:

- 1) Judy Nilsen, Chairman-Visual Arts in Public Places/Sec.-Arts Collaborative Board.
- 2) Ginny Brush, Visual Arts in Public Places Committee member and Arts Collaborative Board.
- 3) Erin Feinblatt; spoke in support.
- 4) Crista Dix, commercial space photography artist.
- 5) Aaron Goldschmidt, adjacent resident; spoke in support of the proposed project, but had parking density, lack of pedestrian cross walks, and other public safety concerns for the neighborhood that should be included in the Environmental Assessment of the project.
- 6) Charles Donelan, SB Independent Arts Editor; spoke in support of the proposed project providing high quality support for all artists in the Santa Barbara area.
- 7) Sol Hill, local artist; in support of a lively art funk zone for the working artist community.

Letters of concern from Chuck Coleman, and June & Terry O'Rourke; and letters of support from Deanna Graves, Philip Koplin, Stafford Taylor, Ted Mills, Nathan Vonk, and Nils Hammerbeck were acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 7:20 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer, and to return to Full Board, with comments:

- 1) Provide a more detailed lighting and light fixture plan.
- 2) Any approval shall be limited to a 3-5 year approval and return for further rotation review.
- 3) Study relocating the Airstream trailers closer to the existing bathrooms and sewer lines.
- 4) Provide a color board.
- 5) Study providing bicycle parking amenities.
- 6) The Board finds that the proposed project meets the Compatibility Analysis as follows:
 - a) Compliance with the Design Guidelines and consistency with the City Charter and applicable Municipal Code requirements *could not* be determined at this time.
 - b) The project's architectural design is compatible with the City and the architectural character of the neighborhood.
 - c) The project's mass, size, bulk, height, and scale are appropriate for the neighborhood, given compliance with the previous comments provided here.
 - d) There are no impacts to adjacent City Landmarks, adjacent historic resources or nearby designated historic resources, City structures of merit, sites, or natural features.
 - e) The project's design does not block established public views of mountains or ocean.
 - f) An acceptable amount of open space and landscaping for the project's design *could not* be determined at this time.

Action: Gradin/Miller, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Hopkins stepped down, Cung absent).

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:10 P.M. ****

CONSENT CALENDAR (1:00 P.M.)

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by **Stephanie Poole** and **Courtney Jane Miller**.

ABR - NEW ITEM**A. 418 N MILPAS ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-311-033
Application Number: MST2014-00433
Owner: Riviera Vista I
Applicant: Vanguard Planning, LLC
Designer: Amy Von Protz

(Proposal for work at two addresses with two separate Assessor parcel numbers. Proposed at 418 N. Milpas Street (APN031-311-033) is to construct a 206 linear foot, 8'-0" tall wooden fence with 20'-0" wide automatic swing gate, a 10'-0" wide wooden swing gate, and a new trash enclosure. Also proposed is the removal of the barbed wire from atop an existing 8'-0" tall chain link perimeter fence. Proposed at 823 E. Mason Street (APN017-083-018) is to permit commercial auto storage at the rear of an existing single-family dwelling, and to install eight new steel bollards at the rear of the lot. This project will address violations identified in enforcement case ENF2014-00310.)

Present: Jarrett Gorin, Agent.

Continued one week to Consent Review.

ABR - PROJECT DESIGN AND FINAL REVIEW**B. 3328 STATE ST****C-2/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 053-324-011
Application Number: MST2014-00209
Owner: Bryan William McCann
Applicant: Darkmoon Building Design and Construction
Business Name: Instrumental Music

(Proposal for a streetscape façade remodel on an existing 3,161 square foot one-story commercial building. No other changes are proposed on this 6,750 square foot parcel.)

(Project was last reviewed by the full board on May 27, 2014. Project scope has been reduced and project no longer requires a zoning modification. Proposed signage and light fixtures to be reviewed under separate sign permit application.)

Present: Jonathan Villegas, Architect.

Continued one week to Consent Review with a request for a landscape plan.

ABR - REVIEW AFTER FINAL**C. 709 E HALEY ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-232-017
Application Number: MST2011-00077
Owner: Corina A. Figueroa
Owner: Jaime and Robin Melgoza
Architect: Rex Ruskauff

(Proposal to convert an existing 504 square foot one-story residence to commercial use and add 381 square feet to the front of the building. A new 1,000 square foot four-car carport with 1,000 square feet of uncovered storage area above the parking spaces is proposed at the rear of the 5,200 square foot lot. The project will result in 885 square feet of new commercial floor area.)

(Review After Final of revised trash can storage area.)

Present: Rex Ruskauff, Architect.

Final Approval of Review After Final as noted on plan Sheet A1.11.

**** CONSENT REVIEW ADJOURNED AT 1:45 P.M. ****