



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Tuesday, February 18, 2014

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

PAUL ZINK, *Chair*
KIRK GRADIN *Vice-Chair*
THIEP CUNG
SCOTT HOPKINS
COURTNEY JANE MILLER
STEPHANIE POOLE
WM. HOWARD WITTAUSCH

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON (Alternate): JOHN CAMPANELLA

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician
KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary
GABRIELA FELICIANO, *Pro tempore* Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.SantaBarbaraCA.gov/ABRVideos.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:05 p.m. by Chair Zink.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Zink, Cung, Gradin, Hopkins, Miller, Poole (at 3:07 p.m.), and Wittausch (at 3:13 p.m.)

Staff present: Boughman, Limón (from 3:17 p.m. to 3:27 p.m.) and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Trevor Martinson, Architect, commented on the project located at 510 N. Salsipuedes Street which was granted Final Approval on the February 10, 2014, Consent Agenda. His concerns are that many new plan sheets were submitted with additional information. Of particular concern are additions to roof areas, new solar panels, a part of the structure is over the 45 foot height limit, and FEMA issues on the floodplain. He provided written comments dated February 13, 2014, and requested that the project return for Full Board review, rather than ratification of the Final Approval on the Consent Agenda.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **February 3, 2014**, with corrections.

Action: Gradin/Hopkins, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Cung abstained, Wittausch absent.)

C. Consent Agenda:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Agenda of **February 10, 2014**, as reviewed by Kirk Gradin; with the exception of Item B at 510 N. Salsipuedes Street, which was reviewed by Kirk Gradin and Courtney Jane Miller.

Action: Poole/Gradin, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Agenda of **Tuesday, February 18, 2014**, as reviewed by Stephanie Poole; with the exception of Item C at 412 Anacapa Street, which was reviewed by Courtney Jane Miller.

Action: Poole/Hopkins, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Chair Zink announced he would be stepping down from Agenda Item #1 at 706 E. Haley Street.
2. Mr. Boughman announced that on Tuesday, February 25, 2014, City Council Ordinance Committee will consider proposed amendments to the Municipal Code related to the maximum allowed height of fences, screens, walls, and hedges. Also included are allowances for certain features to exceed the height limits, including guard rails, decorative elements, and entry way arbors; and to allow for administrative review and approval of minor exceptions to the regulations.
3. Mr. Limón reported that the Historic Landmarks Commission requested that the Design Awards be conducted separately by the HLC and ABR to allow the HLC to recognize more projects within El Pueblo Viejo District.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

There were no subcommittee reports.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM1. **706 E HALEY ST****C-2 Zone****(3:10)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-301-002

Application Number: MST2014-00010

Owner: Santa Barbara Land Company

Applicant: JM Holliday Associates

Agent: Jerry Rocci

(Proposal for a complete interior and exterior remodel of an existing mixed use building consisting of 1,300 square feet of commercial space and five residential units on a 10,000 square foot site. The remodel consists of a new floor plan configuration, new exterior patio and trellis along Haley Street, and new entries for the residential units.)

(Second review; project was last reviewed on January 21, 2014. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 3:22 p.m.

Present: Michael Holiday, Architect
 Jerry Rocci, Agent
 Roger Dickson, Property Owner Representative

Public comment opened at 3:41 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent for final with conditions:

- 1) Trash enclosure should be shown along with site utilities that would affect aesthetics.
- 2) Show location of exterior lighting on the plans.
- 3) Provide landscape plan.
- 4) Roof should be a pre-finished material rather than raw galvanized.
- 5) Provide roof top window details.
- 6) Clarify the window treatment. Study adding greater depth to the plaster recess at the windows.
- 7) Study eliminating the thin plaster corner elements on the Haley Street elevation.
- 8) Unify the palette of the metal finishes as much as possible.
- 9) A deeper ocher color is preferred, as indicated on renderings, as opposed to what was presented on the color board.
- 10) Grey should be more in the direction of the putty color.
- 11) Although the majority of the Commission found the proposed trellis supportable, it was suggested that applicant restudy the front trellis element/proportion to possibly improve functionality.

Action: Gradin/Poole, 5/1/0. Motion carried. (Wittausch opposed as he felt the project was not ready for Project Design Approval. Zink stepped down.)

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:24 PM TO 4:25 PM ****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**2. 134 S MILPAS ST****C-2/SD-3 Zone****(3:40)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-203-013
 Application Number: MST2013-00309
 Owner: Aied M. Abdullatif
 Architect: Jim Armstrong

(Proposal to construct a 724 square foot addition to the 1,125 square foot one-story automobile service station and mini-mart building. The proposal includes site improvements to provide a new trash enclosure, removal of the existing 257 square foot storage building, restriping the existing parking lot to provide 7 standard parking spaces and one accessible parking space, and minor alterations to the existing landscaping. Planning Commission review is requested for a Coastal Development Permit and an amendment to the Conditional Use Permit.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment and Planning Commission review of a Conditional Use Permit and an amendment to the Conditional Use Permit. Project Compatibility Analysis consideration is requested.)

Actual time: 4:25 p.m.

Present: James E. Armstrong, Architect, JEA Architects; and Nick Eubank
 Kelly Brodison, Assistant Planner

Public comment opened at 4:31 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

- 1) Proposed changes to windows and removal of existing covering would be an improvement to the building.
- 2) Architecturally disguise the vertical vent with either landscaping or by relocating and attaching it to the building.
- 3) Provide a landscape plan. Upgrade the existing landscaping that is to remain and add more landscaping where feasible.
- 4) Restudy the trellis details at the trash enclosure to be more in keeping with the style of the building and the awning at the rear doorway.
- 5) The Board looks forward to the findings of the Transportation Division regarding Parking Space # 7 at Cacique Street and accessibility to trash enclosure.
- 6) Research the lighting of the building and previous approvals, and make sure it is in keeping with City Ordinances. If a change to the lighting is proposed, assure that the conduit is concealed and in keeping with Design Guidelines.
- 7) Restudy the height of the parapet and simplify to be more in keeping with the design of the project.
- 8) The Board has reviewed the proposed project and **Compatibility Analysis Criteria** have been generally met for this project (per SBMC 22.22.145.B. and 22.68.045.B.) as follows:
 - a. **Compliance:** The proposed project complies with the Design Guidelines and is consistent with the City Charter and applicable Municipal Code requirements.
 - b. **Compatibility:** The project's design is compatible with the City and the architectural character of the neighborhood.
 - c. **Appropriate Size, mass, bulk, height, and scale:** The mass, size, bulk, height, and scale of the existing building are appropriate for its location and the neighborhood, but the parapet height of the proposed addition to the rear of the building should be slightly higher or lower to reduce uniformity and differentiation from the existing structure in a distinguished way, and for screening of proposed new mechanical equipment.
 - d. **Sensitivity to Adjacent Historic Resources:** There are no impacts to adjacent City Landmarks, adjacent historic resources or nearby designated historic resources, City structures of merit, sites, or natural features.
 - e. **Public Views:** The project's design does not block established public views of mountains or ocean.
 - f. **Open Space/Landscaping:** The project's design provides an acceptable/ appropriate amount of open space and landscaping, but the applicant was asked to add more landscaping on the northeast corner of the building. The reduction of landscaping (at Parking Space # 8) is acceptable because it is offset by added landscaping and improvements elsewhere.

Action: Poole/Miller, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**3. 510 CASTILLO ST****C-P Zone****(4:10)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-152-029
 Application Number: MST2014-00034
 Owner: Mary Kay Robinson Living Trust
 Architect: Hochhauser Blatter Architects

(Proposal to remodel all exterior façades of the existing three-story office building. The project includes new solar panels on roof, new green wall screens, exterior solar shades, and replacement of existing wall sheathing.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 5:00 p.m.

Present: Jan R. Hochhauser, Architect
 Orelia Rojo, Associate Architect
 Kirk Autio, Owner

Public comment opened at 5:11 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

- 1) The Board is very much in support of the project's goals in creating a sustainable office building in a significant way.
- 2) Some Board members felt that the proposed materials are incompatible with the neighborhood, that applicant should restudy the combination of materials and perhaps simplify to be in a more compatible palette.
- 3) There is concern about an apparent top-heaviness with visual mass being added to the building with the additional outdoor deck areas at the third floor and the PV panel roof extending out to the limits of the deck.
- 4) There is concern about too much uniformity of treatment on all sides of the building.
- 5) Provide clear color renditions of the building with some of the existing landscaping added to get a better understanding of what the building will look like when completed.

Action: Gradin/Hopkins, 6/1/0. (Cung opposed.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**4. 122 S VOLUNTARIO ST****R-2 Zone****(4:40)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-213-011
 Application Number: MST2014-00047
 Owner: Jane Barrett
 Architect: Eric Swenumson

(Proposal for a new two-story 3,006 square foot duplex at the rear of a lot, a new three-car carport, and three uncovered parking spaces. The existing 985 square foot one-story single-family residence will remain at the front of the lot.)

(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment.)

Actual time: 5:56 p.m.

Present: Eric Swenumson, Architect
Jane Barrett, Owner

Public comment opened at 6:00 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with comments:

- 1) Provide a landscape plan and location of the trash enclosure on the site plan. Include site fencing details.
- 2) Consider replicating the detailing and character of the front house, particularly on the east elevation.
- 3) Provide more architectural character to the north elevation.
- 4) Consider removing the "tacked on" roof on the south elevation.
- 5) Although some members felt that a horizontal shiplap siding would be more appropriate, others found a vertical siding supportable.
- 6) Design the carports in a craftsman style.
- 7) Review window placements, muttons and sizes for the design and standardized proportions.
- 8) Study the roof overhangs at the north elevation and perhaps resolve in a different manner.

Action: Hopkins/Wittausch, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

CONSENT AGENDA (1:00 P.M.)

ABR - CONTINUED ITEM

A. 35 N CALLE CÉSAR CHÁVEZ

OM-1/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-113-004
Application Number: MST2012-00486
Owner: Verde Ventures, LLC
Architect: Studio R

(Proposal to demolish and replace two existing one-story storage buildings in the same locations; one is 3,798 square feet, and the other is 3,278 square feet. They will be constructed with concrete bases, metal siding, and roofs. The square footage of the buildings will not change, and seven parking spaces are proposed to remain. **Staff Hearing Officer review of a Coastal Development Permit and a Conditional Use Permit to allow non-ocean-oriented business to be conducted on site is requested.** The project also includes permitting an as-built, 1,341 square foot, one-story storage building requiring Development Plan approval, and permitting as-built benches and fountain.)

(Request to state for the record the ABR's consideration of the Project Compatibility Analysis criteria.)

The Project Compatibility Analysis Criteria have been met with the following comments:

- 1) The project's design is consistent with the existing site and the industrial zone. The existing function will remain.
- 2) It is consistent with the architectural character of the existing property and neighborhood.
- 3) The size, mass, scale, and height are appropriate and close to what was there before. It is smaller than the adjacent warehouses.
- 4) There are no adjacent historic resources.
- 5) The buildings remain in the same locations and approximate heights and thus do not impact public vistas.
- 6) The open space and landscaping has been improved dramatically. Return with a landscape plan by a licensed landscape architect.

ABR - FINAL REVIEW**B. 200 BLK W COTA ST (1989 SEG ID)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-989
 Application Number: MST2011-00054
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Jessica Grant

(Proposal to demolish an existing bridge deck and abutments and replace them with cast-in-steel shell piles supporting a reinforced concrete pile cap at each end of the bridge. New bridge deck to be installed atop the new abutments.)

Present: David Black, Landscape Architect

Final Approval with the condition that the replacement roof material must match existing roof. Return material and photos to Staff for verification.

ABR - FINAL REVIEW**C. 412 ANACAPA ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-271-019
 Application Number: MST2008-00322
 Owner: Anabilt, LLC
 Applicant: Anabilt Properties LLC
 Architect: Shubin & Donaldson

(the proposal includes subdividing an existing 13,500 square foot vacant parcel into three new lots and to construct a new three-story sustainable mixed-use building on each new parcel. The proposal includes a total of 4,074 commercial square feet and 7,113 residential square feet. Lot one includes 1,374 square feet of commercial area and a 1,658 square foot residential unit on a 4,760 square foot lot. Lot two includes 1,344 square feet of commercial area and a 1,616 square foot residential unit on a 5,070 square foot lot. Lot 3 includes 538 square feet of commercial area and a 2,552 square foot residential unit on a 3,670 square foot lot. A total of 10 parking spaces (four covered and six uncovered) are proposed for the project. **The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review of a Tentative Subdivision Map and Development Plan Approval.**)

(Final review of landscaping.)

Final Approval of the landscaping plan with conditions:

- 1) Provide an alternative planting to the proposed bamboo in the 6-inch wide planting areas along the north property line.
- 2) Provide gravel instead of decomposed granite at the rear of Building 3.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:22 P.M. ****