



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, September 17, 2012 630 Garden Street: David Gebhard Public Meeting Room 3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS: DAWN SHERRY, *Chair*
 PAUL ZINK, *Vice Chair*
 CHRISTOPHER GILLILAND
 GARY MOSEL
 KIRK GRADIN
 STEPHANIE POOLE

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician
 GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high-speed internet access at www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr and select *Meeting Videos*.

Board members conducted independent site visits to 601 E. Micheltorena Street prior to the meeting.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:01 p.m. by Chair Sherry.

Members present: Gradin, Mosel, Poole, Sherry (out 5:39 to 5:46, left at 6:15), Zink

Members absent: Gilliland

Staff present: Boughman, Limon (present 3:01 to 3:18 and 4:16 to 5:39), Shafer

A. Public Comment: No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of Tuesday, September 4, 2012 as amended.

Action: Mosel/Gradin, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gilliland absent)

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of September 10, 2012. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Dawn Sherry, with Item E reviewed by Kirk Gradin, and Item C, and landscaping reviewed by Chris Gilliland.

Action: Gradin/Zink, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gilliland absent)

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of September 17, 2012. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Paul Zink.

Action: Zink/Gradin, 5/0/0. Motion carried (Gilliland absent)

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.
1. Mr. Boughman announced that Mr. Gilliland is absent.
 2. Mr. Boughman announced that a representative from the ABR is needed to serve as Sign Committee Consent Calendar Alternate reviewer and a representative is needed to review the ABR Consent Calendar alternating with Paul Zink. Mr. Zink agreed to serve as ABR Consent reviewer through December. Mr. Gradin agreed to serve as the ABR Consent alternate review and the SIGN Committee alternate reviewer as needed. Ms. Sherry agreed to continue to serving as the primary ABR representative on the Sign Committee.
 3. Mr. Limon announced that recruitment is underway for Board and Commission members and the ABR will have new members at the end of the year. Chris Gilliland has indicated he will not renew when his term expires at the end of this year and the ABR will be recruiting for a landscape architect.
- E. Subcommittee Reports. There were no reports.

DISCUSSION ITEM

(3:10) Fire-Resistant Building Design, Construction, and Landscaping.

Preview of the AIA ArchitecTours 2012 scheduled for September 29, 2012.

Preview of nine projects along with the City Fire Department's presentations for the public.

American Institute of Architects, Santa Barbara Chapter representatives

Christopher Manson-Hing, AIASB Secretary; and Susanne Tejada, AIASB President

Actual time: 3:11 p.m.

Present: Susanne Kortz-Tejada, AIASB President and Christopher Manson-Hing, AIASB Secretary;

Ms. Kortz-Tejada and Mr. Manson-Hing reported that the 2012 AIA ArchitecTours Santa Barbara will be held on Saturday, September 29 from 9am - 4pm. The theme of this year's ArcitecTour is fire-resistant building design, construction, and landscaping. The tour is a self-guided with architects and construction teams, demonstrating innovative fire-resistant strategies to apply to one's home or business. There will also be displays and informational activities at a site that has yet to be determined, and the tour coincides with the flying of AIA flags on State Street. It was reported that ticket sales have surpassed all previous year sales, and because lunch is included for every attendee, the public is encouraged to purchase tickets in advance as soon as possible. Additional information can be found on the AIA website: www.aiasb.com .

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**1. 2204 PARKWAY DR****R-3 Zone**

(3:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-171-031
Application Number: MST2012-00070
Owner: Nicholas Kalionzes
Designer: Angeli De Covolo Inc.
Engineer: John Oeltman
Architect: Angeli De Covolo, Inc.

Proposal for a new two-story building consisting of a 510 square foot second-floor dwelling unit above a new 721 square foot three-car garage located at the rear of the property. The existing 1,023 square foot one-story single residence located on the 5,032 square foot lot will remain unchanged. Total development on site will be 2,254 square feet. The building is proposed to be located at the property line to the north adjacent to the commercial zoned property and encroaches into the interior setback. Staff Hearing Officer review of a zoning modification for the setback encroachment occurred.

Project Design Approval of the project is requested. Requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution 033-12. Project was last reviewed on June 25, 2012.

Actual time: 3:18 p.m.

Present: Gil Garcia, Architect.

Staff comments: Mr. Boughman reported Staff Hearing Officer's comments concerning privacy from the deck for the adjacent neighbor, and a condition of approval stating that hedges shall not exceed 8 ft in height.

Public comment was opened at 3:22 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks to the Full Board with the following comments:

1. Provide a landscape plan that includes a path to the rear units.
2. Provide landscape screening for the property to the south.
3. Show the proposed second floor planter box design; two board members felt the planter box should be eliminated, others felt the box could work if designed properly and incorporated with higher elements on the south elevation such as trellis or lattice for privacy.
4. Show proper finished/total height of the building.
5. Carry forward of comment #3 from the minutes of June 25, 2012: 3) Study reducing the proposed height by reducing plate heights or other options.
6. Show the trash location.

Action: Gradin/Poole, 4/0/1. Motion carried. (Zink abstained, Gilliland absent)

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**2. 400 W PUEBLO ST (COTTAGE HOSPITAL)****SP-8 Zone**

(3:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-100-001
Application Number: MST2012-00091
Owner: Santa Barbara Cottage Hospital
Agent: Sac Wireless Engineering Group

Proposal for a new wireless communications facility for Verizon Wireless. The proposal consists of a new 336 square foot, 8 foot tall equipment platform enclosure on the hospital roof, a new 49 square foot, 8 foot tall antenna screening enclosure on the existing penthouse roof to contain six new wireless antennas, and 3 new antennas mounted on the exterior of the penthouse.

Second Concept Review; project was last reviewed on April 16, 2012. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires a finding of no adverse visual impacts and compatibility analysis.

Actual time: 3:38 p.m.

Present: Trisha Knight, Verizon; Duwayne Bonheim, Engineer.

Public comment was opened at 3:45 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks to the Full Board with the following comments:

1. The Board is looking for any elements added to the building to be fully and properly integrated into the existing architectural detailing of the existing building.
2. Reduce as much as possible the dimensional elements being added to screen the roof top equipment, whether in thickness, height, width or depth.
3. Carry down to the roof, the antenna screening at the ends of the penthouse to not appear to be cantilevering; show element details and connections to the existing wall and how they will be surfaced and treated.
4. Show the entire of conduit path from point of connection at the street to the exterior of the building. Show any changes to the building at every level. Including sidewalk and planting areas, handicapped ramps, existing pillars, etc. Show exact dimensional features, and finished texture of any element that is changing on the existing building.
5. Provide height and width dimensions for the roof top cable tray, including the number and sizes of conduits.
6. Provide photographs indicating whether or not the penthouse and additions are visible.

Action: Gradin/Zink, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gilliland absent)

** The Board recessed from 4:09 to 4:16 p.m. **

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**3. 601 E MICHELTORENA ST****C-O Zone**

(4:20) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-270-030
 Application Number: MST2003-00827
 Owner: Santa Barbara Cottage Hospital Foundation
 Agent: Ken Marshall
 Architect: Cearnal, Andrulaitis LLP
 Landscape Architect: Katie O'Reilly-Rogers

The Santa Barbara Cottage Hospital Foundation Workforce Housing Project will remove the former St. Francis Hospital complex, including the main hospital, convent, central plant, and other ancillary structures and construct 115 residential condominiums that will cover approximately 5.94 acres of the 7.39 acre site. Eighty-one of the units will be sold to Cottage Hospital employees at prices within the City's structure for affordable units and 34 units will be sold at market rates. The project will provide approximately 265 parking spaces, including 254 parking spaces for the 115 condominium units and 11 spaces for the Villa Riviera facility. The project was approved by the Planning Commission on September 21, 2006 (Resolution No. 039-06), and by the City Council on December 19, 2006 (Resolution No. 06-103), and April 29, 2008 (Resolution No. 08-038).

Review After Final for revised building finishes including paint colors, window colors, stonework, roof coverings, and solar panels. Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolutions 039-06, 06-103, and 08-038.

Actual time: 4:16 p.m.

Present: Joe Andrulaitis, Architect.

Public comment was opened at 4:24 p.m.

Cheri McKinney, expressed concern for the salmon and pastel yellow colors.

Stephen Fountain, expressed concern for the colors, particularly the salmon, red, and green colors.

Rogelio Trujillo, expressed concern for the yellow and red colors, the stone veneer walls installed at Micheltorena, and the lack of window details on building D1.

Jessica Smith, expressed concern for the color palette and the lack of window details of units along Micheltorena (also submitted copies of a letter to the Board).

Robert Blackburn, many units are nicely done, however, some units lack the Craftsman character.

Public comment was closed at 4:40 p.m.

Staff comments: Nicole Hernandez, City Historian, explained that a dark burnt brick red body color with white trim and a third accent color was traditionally used on Craftsman style homes.

Failed

Motion: Continued two weeks to the Full Board with the following comments:

1. Provide a detail showing that a two-inch imitation stone veneer was proposed from the beginning.

2. A majority of the board feels the red color on building H1 is fine, but should be deeper/darker red.
3. A majority of the board feels that building D1 needs attention to detail. It was suggested to add shutters and additional detailing; some board members feel shutters are not enough.
4. Solar panels are approved as submitted.

Action: Gradin. Motion failed. (Gilliland absent)

Mr. Limon suggested the Board take straw votes on individual issues. Chair Sherry called for the following votes:

Straw vote: how many can approve the stone wall as constructed: 2/3/0, majority opposed.

Straw vote: how many can approve the existing red building as painted: 0/5/0. No support.

Straw vote: how many can approve the existing butterscotch color without additional detailing: 0/5/0. No support.

Straw vote: how many can approve the solar panels: 4/1/0. Majority in support.

Substitute

Motion: Continued two weeks to the Full Board with the following comments:

1. Paint building H1 a darker red that matches the lower floor color.
2. The solar panels are approved as submitted.
3. Return with original plan details showing whether real stone veneer or imitation veneer was approved for building walls.
4. Restudy the color palette for building D1.
5. Return with additional window detailing for building D1.

Action: Mosel/Gradin, 4/1/0. Motion carried. Zink opposed to the as-built walls. (Gilliland absent)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM

4. 120 S HOPE AVE

C-2/SD-2 Zone

(4:50)

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-010-014
 Application Number: MST2012-00361
 Owner: Nettleship Patricia S Trustee
 Owner: Macerich Company
 Architect: Ryan Mills

Proposal to complete the La Cumbre Plaza facade upgrades to all buildings per the current Tenant Design Criteria. Square footage changes are not proposed. Conceptual or project approval of proposed facade upgrades on buildings A through K, and development of a plan for phased final approvals on a building-by-building basis is requested. The goal is to secure all permits and complete construction of all proposed work at La Cumbre Plaza by 2015.

Actual time: 5:39 p.m.

Present: Ryan Mills, Architect; Trey Lindle, Representing Macerich Company

Public comment was opened at 6:05 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

The Board offered support for the concept with the following comments: The proposed plan for changes by mall ownership is appreciated. It was agreed that the process for review of the project could be as proposed for three phases, with up to three buildings per phase, and with separate approvals for each phase. The project is to be reviewed by the full board unless specific items are continued to the Consent Calendar. (Gilliland and Sherry were absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

5. 635 OLIVE ST

C-M Zone

(5:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-160-012
 Application Number: MST2012-00156
 Owner: David Potter
 Architect: Michael Porter

Proposal to demolish the existing 940 square foot one-story single- residence and construct a three-story mixed-use building with a basement and roof deck. The project consists of 2,997 square feet of commercial wine production and storage space and 1,429 square feet of residential space with an attached 424 square foot one-car garage and three uncovered parking spaces.

Fourth Concept Review. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment. Project requires Compatibility Analysis and Development Plan Approval findings. Project was last reviewed on September 4, 2012.

Actual time: 6:23 p.m.

Present: Michael Porter, Architect; Kimberly True, Landscape Architect.

Public comment was opened at 6:29 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Failed

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the comment to return with a plaster finish on south and west elevations, and an alternative plaster color, otherwise the project is acceptable.

Action: Gradin. Motion failed. (Sherry/Gilliland absent.)

Substitute

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

1. The movement toward fenestration on the lot line walls, and the reduction of the 33-foot wall heights at the pedestrian sidewalk are appreciated.
2. The Board looks forward to a review by the landscape architect.
3. Provide details for the block work, included the proposed finish and grouting joints.
4. Provide a realistic color elevation drawing of the anodized aluminum frame with green tint glass.

Action: Mosel/Poole, 3/1/0. Motion carried. (Gradin opposed to block walls without plaster, Sherry/Gilliland absent.)

***** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:51 P.M. *****

CONSENT CALENDAR (1:00)

Representatives present: Paul Zink
 Staff present: Tony Boughman

ABR - FINAL REVIEW**A. SYCAMORE CREEK, PUNTA GORDA STREET**

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-603
 Application Number: MST2009-00374
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Jessica Grant

Proposal for the Lower Sycamore Creek Channel Widening and Punta Gorda Street Bridge Replacement Project. The project includes channel improvements beginning at the north side of the Caltrans right-of-way line and extending to a point approximately 75 feet upstream of the Punta Gorda Street Bridge. The project includes the replacement of the Punta Gorda Street Bridge and a creek restoration plan.

Project was last reviewed on May 14, 2012.

Final Approval with conditions: 1) provide wrought iron fencing at the north corner, same height as bridge railing; 2) all three other corners to be black chain link fencing, same height as the bridge railing, for a distance of 10 feet; 3) Inside bridge rail distance to proposed utility pole to be 3'9", to be out of arm's reach.

ABR - NEW ITEM**B. 620 LAGUNA ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-160-016
 Application Number: MST2012-00352
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Public Works Engineering

This project will be reviewed in two phases. Phase I includes ABR review of: drilling and construction of a 675 to 700 foot deep water supply well at grade; 18" tall by 9 sq. ft. equipment installation; and construction of a temporary 24' tall, 471 linear foot sound wall is to remain for six to eight weeks to contain drilling sounds. Later, Phase 2 ABR review will be for construction of a permanent perimeter fence and installation of water transmission lines and power supply.

Project Design Approval and Final Approval of Phase I are requested.

Phase I received Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the comment that the color of green fencing to be dark Hunter Green or something similar to Malaga Green. Phase II was continued indefinitely with the comment that the fencing may be galvanized with slats.

ABR - NEW ITEM**C. 231 W MONTECITO ST****C-2/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-032-002
Application Number: MST2012-00297
Owner: George Alexiades
Architect: Michael Stroh

Proposal for tenant improvements for a new restaurant use. The minor exterior changes include a new front door and storefront window replacement. A new rear door and new lighting at the front entrance was previously approved.

Continued one week for the applicant to study a more traditional window design with a sill, and elimination of the old window sill. Rooftop mechanical equipment and associated screening is to be reviewed under a future application.

ABR - NEW ITEM**D. 514 W MONTECITO ST****R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-222-032
Application Number: MST2012-00365
Owner: Housing Authority/City of Santa Barbara
Architect: Tom Moore

Proposal for an as-built trash enclosure.

Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.

Project Design Approval and Final Approval as built.