



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, June 14, 2010 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS:

- CHRISTOPHER MANSON-HING, Chair - ABSENT
 DAWN SHERRY, Vice-Chair – PRESENT UNTIL 5:31 P.M.
 CLAY AURELL - PRESENT
 CAROL GROSS – ABSENT
 GARY MOSEL – PRESENT @ 3:15 P.M.
 PAUL ZINK – PRESENT (SERVED AS SUBSTITUTE VICE-CHAIR)
 KEITH RIVERA - PRESENT

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO - ABSENT GRANT HOUSE (ALTERNATE) - ABSENT

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT – ABSENT STELLA LARSON (ALTERNATE) - ABSENT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – PRESENT UNTIL 3:20 P.M.
 MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician - PRESENT
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary - PRESENT

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See ABR Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded</u> plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. Rough sketches are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following Architectural Board of Review (ABR) agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, a rescheduling fee will be paid and the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) in addition to submitting appropriate plans.
- All approvals made by the ABR are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.68 and with adopted ABR guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- The ABR may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- The Board may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Architectural Board of Review approval.
- Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- Decisions of the ABR may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall, 735 Anacapa St. within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Board took action or rendered its decision.
- **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the ABR after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Michelle Bedard, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday, or by email at mbedard@santabarbaraca.gov. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the city of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

1. That on Wednesday, June 9, 2010, at 4:00 p.m., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr.
2. This regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review will be broadcast live on City TV-18, or on your computer via <http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video/> and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. City TV-18 will also rebroadcast this meeting in its entirety on Wednesday at 8:00 a.m. on Channel 18. An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high speed internet access the following Wednesday at www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:06 p.m.

ROLL CALL:

Members present: Sherry (present until 5:31 p.m.), Mosel (present @ 3:15 p.m.), Zink, Aurell, and Rivera.
Members absent: Manson-Hing, Gross, and Gilliland.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment: No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **June 1, 2010, as submitted.**

Action: Aurell/Rivera, 3/0/1. Motion carried. (Zink abstained, Manson-Hing/Gross/Mosel/Gilliland absent).

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **June 7, 2010**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Clay Aurell**.

Action: Aurell/Rivera, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Manson-Hing/Gross/Mosel/Gilliland absent).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **June 14, 2010**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Gary Mosel**.

Action: Rivera/Aurell, 4/0/0. Motion carried. (Manson-Hing/Gross/Mosel/Gilliland absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1) Ms. Bedard announced that Board members Gross and Manson-Hing would be absent from the meeting.

2) Mr. Limon announced that an appeal was filed for 3052 State Street, Beverages & More, and is tentatively scheduled for City Council on July 27, 2010, and requests an ABR member representative to attend the hearing.

E. Subcommittee Reports: None.

*** THE FOLLOWING DISCUSSION ITEM WAS TENTATIVELY POSTPONED TO JULY 12TH *.**

DISCUSSION ITEM:

(3:15)

2010 DESIGN REVIEW TRAINING #1: "THE I GO CAR SHARING PROGRAM", AMERICAN PLANNING ASSOCIATION PRESENTATION

City Staff Presenter: Heather Baker, Project Planner; and Jaime Limón, Senior Planner.

(Approximately: a 45 minute recorded PowerPoint presentation and 15 minute discussion.)

Car sharing programs, growing in popularity across the U.S., are becoming an important tool to reduce car use and congestion in urban areas. I-GO Car Sharing, a Chicago-based nonprofit with more than 6,000 members, provides mobility when needed without car ownership expenses. More than half of I-GO members either sold or put off buying a car when they joined. Where car sharing is available, demand for parking goes down, and land previously devoted to parking can be put to other uses. Less parking reduces the costs of building and owning housing and commercial developments and fewer cars reduces CO₂ emissions and other pollutants. Sharon Feigon of I-GO Car Sharing provides background on how car sharing works, talks about its many benefits, and discusses car sharing innovations that link it more closely with a variety of transportation alternatives.

Sharon Feigon is the CEO of I-GO Car Sharing, an affiliate organization of the Center for Neighborhood Technology (CNT). Prior to that she was CNT's Manager of Research and Development, where she specialized in innovative market-based solutions to the problems of urban sprawl, and she coordinated CNT's transit oriented development program. Feigon is the author of *The New Transit Town* (Island Press, 2003). She has an MBA from DePaul University and a B.A. in economics from Antioch College.

To preview this training, see: <http://www.planning.org/tuesdaysatapa/2008/jan.htm>

This is the first in a three-part series of City of Santa Barbara 2010 Design Review Trainings. Parts 2 and 3 of the 2010 Design Review Trainings are scheduled as follows. All board and commission members and the public are encouraged to attend these trainings as well:

Part 2: June 21st, 3:10 PM Enhancing Your Community Through Tree Preservation (First discussion item at SFDB).

Part 3: June 24th, 1:45 PM Lessons from the Last Boom in Chicago (First discussion item at HLC. Please note: This HLC meeting is on a Thursday).

Discussion tentatively postponed to the next available agenda.

*** THE BOARD BRIEFLY RECESSED AT 3:20 P.M. AND RECOVERED AT 3:53 P.M. ***

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW**1. 535 E MONTECITO ST****M-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-351-010
 Application Number: MST2006-00530
 Owner: Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: John Campanella
 Architect: William Hezmalhalch Architects, Inc.
 Applicant: Bill McReynolds

(The proposal is a redesign of a project previously approved by the Planning Commission. The proposed project consists of 48 residential condominium units in four, two- and three-story buildings, on a 1.8-acre vacant lot. The size of the residential units would vary, ranging between 994 and 2,086 square feet. Each of the four buildings would contain twelve residential units and would have individual courtyards. All units would have a two-car garage, with a mix of side by side configuration and tandem configuration. Four guest parking spaces would be provided, resulting in a total of 100 on-site parking spaces. Vehicle access would be provided from both East Montecito Street and Calle Cesar Chavez. Forty of the 48 units would be sold as below-market rate units. A 14-foot wide shared access easement is provided along the western perimeter of the project site. The prior approvals consisted of a Tentative Subdivision Map, a Modification to provide less than the required amount of guest parking and City Council approval of a Specific Plan (SP-10). The redesigned project received a Substantial Conformance Determination at the Planning Commission on 11/19/2009.)

(Preliminary Approval was granted on 4/19/2010. Final Approval is requested.)

(3:54)

Present: Bill McReynolds, Developer/Partner from City Ventures, Inc.; and Jeff Chelwick from William Hezmalhalch, Architects; Katy O'Reilly-Rogers, Landscape Architect; and Kathleen Kennedy, Associate Planner.

Public comment opened at 4:15 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Straw vote: How many of the Board could support the vinyl windows as proposed? 2/3 (failed, Aurell/Rivera/Mosel opposed).

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Consent with comments:

- 1) Utilize a two-piece clay tile; s-tile is inappropriate.
- 2) Provide an alternative to the proposed vinyl windows.
- 3) Change the fin-like appearance of the area separation walls at the garage cantilevers.
- 4) Return with a different detail for the gable vents at the roof.
- 5) Provide a detail for the 18-inch cantilever; to be designed differently than proposed 4-foot cantilevers at the garage.
- 6) Provide a sample of the cantilever material or the plaster over the foam to verify it is of rigid material.
- 7) Minimize the plaster surrounds at the windows.
- 8) Return with an alternative to the truncated domes.

Action: Rivera/Aurell, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Gilliland/Manson-Hing/Gross absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**2. 512 BATH ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-161-035

Application Number: MST2009-00469

Owner: Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara

Architect: Peikert Group Architects

(The project consists of the demolition of an existing two-story, ten-unit apartment building and carport, and the construction of a two and three-story apartment complex on a 1.10 acre lot by the Housing Authority of the City of Santa Barbara. The proposal includes 53 studio efficiency apartments ranging in size between 320 and 445 square feet, affordable to very low and low-income households to be occupied by tenants with special needs and downtown workers, one two-bedroom 921 square foot managers apartment, two 138 square foot laundry rooms, a 610 square foot recreation room, and a 1,432 square foot community center, 13 covered and 17 uncovered automobile parking spaces, and 29 covered and 6 uncovered bicycle parking spaces. The project also includes a transfer of funds from the Housing Authority to the City of Santa Barbara for construction of a portion of the Lower Mission Creek Flood Control Project. The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications for lot area, parking, distance between buildings, and an interior setback encroachment.)

(Third Concept Review. Comments only; Project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review for requested zoning modifications.)

(4:36)

Present: Lisa Plowman and Gordon Brewer, Peikert Group Architects; David Black, Landscape Architect; and Dan Gullett, Associate Planner.

Public comment opened at 4:53 p.m.

Wanda Livernois spoke of concerns regarding size of the project, parking, and landscaping for the proposed project.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Public comment closed at 4:54 p.m.

Mr. Gullett reported that there are currently story poles posted on the proposed project site.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer to return to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Study the details of the proposed landscape screening along the north property line.
- 2) The Board looks forward to a more detailed mitigation plan for the removal of the existing tree, specifically indicate the size and location of the proposed trees.
- 3) One Board member feels that a vertical break up of the three story north elevation would be more appropriate than the horizontal banding as proposed.
- 4) The Board finds the overall site planning, mass, bulk, and scale acceptable as proposed given the nature of the housing program.
- 5) One Board member expressed concerns regarding the circulation bridges and would look to a design that minimizes the visual impact and contribution to the size, bulk, and scale.

Action: Rivera/Aurell, 3/2/0. Motion carried. (Zink/Mosel opposed, Gilliland/Manson-Hing/Gross absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**3. 1921 BATH ST****R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-352-009
 Application Number: MST2010-00118
 Owner: Joan Chapin Robertson
 Architect: Ken Kruger
 Engineer: John Oeltman
 Contractor: Cunningham-Parris Construction

(Proposal to construct a 192 square foot second-story addition to an existing one-story 1,580 square foot residence, resulting in 1,772 square feet. The 7,500 square foot lot is currently developed with two residential units, the existing one-story 1,580 square foot front residence and the existing two-story 822 square foot rear unit. No alterations are proposed to the existing 822 square foot residence. Each residence has one covered parking space provided within the existing two-car garage.)

(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

(5:16)

Present: Ken Kruger, Architect; and Joan Chapin Robertson, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:26 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the applicant's positive response to the Board's comments.
- 2) The Board feels that the addition is appropriate to the existing structure.

Action: Rivera/Mosel, 4/0/1. Motion carried. (Aurell abstained, Gilliland/Manson-Hing/Gross absent).

*** THE BOARD BRIEFLY RECESSED AT 5:30 P.M. AND RECOVERED AT 6:00 P.M. ***

FINAL REVIEW**4. 522 GARDEN ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-211-023
 Application Number: MST2008-00598
 Owner: Steven Harper
 Designer: Ryan Mills
 Landscape Architect: Chris Gilliland
 Architect: De Vicente and Mills, Architecture (DMA)

(Proposal to demolish an existing 1,460 square foot single-family residence and construct a new, 2,649 square foot, three-story, mixed-use building on a 3,312 square foot lot. The building consists of 392 square feet of new commercial space on the first floor, and an 1,781 square foot residential unit with a 119 square foot deck on the second floor, a 551 square foot deck on the third floor, an attached 476 square foot, two-car garage for the residential unit. Two uncovered parking spaces will be provided for the commercial space. The proposal includes new site landscaping and the relocation of one street tree.)

(Preliminary Approval was granted 2/8/2010. Final Approval is requested.)

(6:00)

Present: Edward De Vincente and Ryan Mills, DMA; and Chris Gilliland, Landscape Architect.

Public comment opened at 6:09 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Motion: Final Approval with conditions:

- 1) Provide the Tier 3 SWMP calculations.
- 2) Provide a 36-inch “pink flame” box tree as the replacement street tree.

Action: Aurell/Mosel, 2/1/1. Motion carried. (Rivera opposed, Zink abstained, Manson-Hing/Gross/Sherry/Gilliland absent).

ADJOURNMENT:

The Full Board meeting adjourned at 6:25 p.m.

CONSENT CALENDAR**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****A. 3759 STATE ST****C-P/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-040-053
Application Number: MST2009-00227
Owner: Regency Realty Group, Inc.
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis
Business Name: Whole Foods
Landscape Architect: Guillermo Gonzalez

(Proposal for a façade remodel for three existing commercial buildings in the C-P/SD-2 Zone. The proposal includes the addition of an outdoor seating area, a new trellis and awnings, grading and restriping the existing 258 space parking lot, ADA improvements, 37 bicycle spaces, and landscape alterations, including the addition of bio-swales.)

(Review After Final to reduce the scope of work for Building No. 1, to retain existing windows and revise new plaster configuration to coordinate with the existing windows to remain.)

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Approved as submitted of Review After Final.

CONTINUED ITEM**B. 608 ANACAPA ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-151-017
Application Number: MST2010-00159
Owner: Jason Leggitt
Architect: James Wilson
Applicant: Jeremiah Higgins

(Proposal to add new roof-top exhaust equipment and associated hood vents for a commercial kitchen, the removal of a window in the stairway/elevator tower, and landscaping alterations located at the Anacapa Plaza, an existing three story mixed-use building.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Final Approval as submitted.

NEW ITEM**C. 817 W SOLA ST****R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-091-005
Application Number: MST2010-00174
Owner: David Dahan
Designer: Mark Morando

(Proposal to abate violations of ENF2010-00056, to include the removal of the "as-built" stone barbeque pit and the "as-built" storage shed at the rear of the property, removal of the "as-built" trellis and wood deck at the rear of the front house, to permit the "as-built" conversion of the 301 square feet garage to an accessory storage area, permit the "as-built" covered balcony at the front of unit B, convert existing covered patio to a one-car carport, to relocate the one uncovered parking space, and reduce all hedges, walls, screens, and fences to the maximum allowed heights. The 11,250 square foot lot is currently developed with three residential units, one single family house and one duplex. No new additions are proposed to the existing units. A total of 5 parking spaces will be provided, with four covered and one uncovered space.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

A letter of concern from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Continued one week with comments:

- 1) Replace one door at the storage with a solid door; remove the other door.
- 2) Add the location and size of the existing ash tree to remain (with tree protection notes).
- 3) Provide landscaping for the required 1,250 square feet of the open yard.
- 4) Add the landscape planter along the rear of the front unit following the fence line (as shown on the originally approved landscape plans).
- 5) Add the removal of the citrus tree to the scope of work.

NEW ITEM**D. CITYWIDE****R-O-W**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 099-999-00A
Application Number: MST2010-00163
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Business Name: NextG Networks

(Proposal to add three (3) antenna micro-cell wireless antenna locations, 400 Block W. Montecito St, 3900 Block La Colina Rd., 100 Block S. Calle Cesar Chavez and associated equipment for the NextG Wireless Network.)

(Comments to the Community Development Director.)

Postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by **Gary Mosel**.