



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, July 27, 2009

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

3:03 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

CHRISTOPHER MANSON-HING, Chair - ABSENT
 DAWN SHERRY, Vice-Chair - PRESENT
 CLAY AURELL - PRESENT
 CAROL GROSS – PRESENT @ 3:17 P.M.
 GARY MOSEL - PRESENT
 PAUL ZINK – PRESENT UNTIL 5:28 P.M.
 CHRISTOPHER GILLILAND – PRESENT
 KEITH RIVERA - PRESENT

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO - ABSENT GRANT HOUSE (ALTERNATE) - ABSENT

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT - ABSENT

STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor - ABSENT
 MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician - PRESENT
 KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary - PRESENT

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See ABR Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<p><u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street)</p> <p><u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised.</p> <p><u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing)</p> <p><u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures.</p> <p><u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.</p>
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p>Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.</p>
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p><u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan.</p> <p><u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.</p>

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following Architectural Board of Review (ABR) agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, a rescheduling fee will be paid and the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) in addition to submitting appropriate plans.
- All approvals made by the ABR are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.68 and with adopted ABR guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- The ABR may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- The Board may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Architectural Board of Review approval.
- Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- Decisions of the ABR may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall, 735 Anacapa St. within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Board took action or rendered its decision.
- **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the ABR after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Michelle Bedard, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday, or by email at mbedard@santabarbaraca.gov. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the city of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

1. That on Thursday, July 23, 2009 at 4:00 p.m., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr.
2. This regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review will be broadcast live on City TV-18, or on your computer via <http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video/> and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. City TV-18 will also rebroadcast this meeting in its entirety on Wednesday at 8:00 a.m. on Channel 18. An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high speed internet access the following Wednesday at www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:03 p.m.

ROLL CALL:

Members present: Sherry (absent from 3:30 p.m. to 3:52 p.m.), Zink (present until 5:28 p.m.), Aurell, Mosel, Rivera, Gilliland, and Gross (present @ 3:17 p.m.).
Members absent: Manson-Hing.
Staff present: Bedard and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:**A. Public Comment:**

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of **July 13, 2009**, 2009, as amended.
Action: Zink/Aurell, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Gross/Manson-Hing absent).

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **July 20, 2009**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Clay Aurell and Carol Gross**.
Action: Aurell/Zink, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Gross/Manson-Hing absent).
Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **July 27, 2009**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Clay Aurell and Carol Gross**.
Action: Aurell/Rivera, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Gross/Manson-Hing absent).

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

- 1) Ms. Bedard made the following announcements:
 - a) Board member Manson-Hing will be absent from the meeting, and Vice-Chair Sherry will be chairing today's meeting in his absence.
 - b) An appeal of the Staff Hearing Officer decision for 617 Bradbury Ave was filed today. As a result this project, which was scheduled for Final Approval on today's agenda (Item #5), has been postponed indefinitely and will not be reviewed today.

- c) Board member Aurell volunteered as the attendee for the City Council hearing scheduled for Tuesday, August 4, for the appeal of the Planning Commission approval for 436 Corona Del Mar (MST2008-00420).
 - d) With Jim Blakeley's recent resignation from the Board, ABR member Paul Zink, who was listed as the alternate liaison to the Visual Arts in Public Places Subcommittee will take Jim's position as the liaison, and Carol Gross will be the new alternate.
 - e) For 803 N. Milpas Street (MST2006-00510), a tentative Planning Commission hearing has been scheduled for August 20, 2009. Story poles will be placed on site for this project.
 - f) A city wide project has been initiated for the installation of Catch Basin Storm Drain Screens at various city locations. Information was distributed to you, the ABR members, via email as a courtesy, however, these projects are exempt from ABR as a building permit is not required. This project was reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission, as a general discussion item, as all exterior changes in the HLC jurisdiction require Design Review.
- 2) Board member Sherry announced that she will temporarily have to leave the meeting at 3:30 p.m.
 - 3) Board member Gilliland announced that he will be absent from the next scheduled meeting on August 10, 2009.
 - 4) Board member Sherry announced that she will be absent from the next scheduled meeting on August 10, 2009.
 - 5) Board member Mosel announced that he will be absent from the next scheduled meeting on August 10, 2009.

E. Subcommittee Reports: None.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM

1. 128 ANACAPA ST

OC/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-083-022
 Application Number: MST2007-00515
 Owner: James B. McDonald
 Architect: Joe Ewing

(Proposal to construct two new three-story residential condominiums, with a fourth level roof terrace on a 5,000 square foot lot. Unit A is three-bedroom 2,249 square feet with an attached 422 square foot two-car garage. Unit B is three-bedroom 2,844 square feet with an attached 446 square foot two-car garage. The project requires Staff Hearing Officer Review for a Tentative Subdivision Map and Coastal Development Permit.)

(Third Concept Review. Comments only; Project requires Environmental Assessment, Compatibility Analysis, and Staff Hearing Officer Review for a Tentative Subdivision Map and Coastal Development Permit.)

(3:14)

Present: Joe Ewing, Architect; and James McDonald, Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:33 p.m.

Kellam de Forest expressed concern regarding the project's proximity to El Pueblo Viejo District neighborhood, the 40-foot building height initiative in relation to the project, and probability of the project's roof terrace becoming a fourth floor.

Joseph Garred, adjacent property owner, expressed concern regarding the legal property line, and would like to request a sun-study to determine the affects to his property.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Public comment closed at 3:38 p.m.

Staff clarified that, per Alison DeBusk, the case planner, the survey of the property lines will be required to be submitted and reviewed prior to the project receiving approval by the Staff Hearing Officer.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the reduction in height of the structure, but finds that the size, mass, and bulk of the building is still too aggressive, including the excessive square footage, and looks for an overall reduction of the mass and bulk. The applicant is encouraged to restudy the interior paseo/court yard as there are specific concerns regarding the function of the interior paseo/court yard and how that may contribute to the aggressive mass, bulk, and scale, additional concerns include the lack of sun light, and the lack of windows in this interior paseo.
- 2) The Board generally feels the architecture is headed in the right direction; however, there are concerns regarding the street façade, including the continued lack of a street and pedestrian/neighborhood presence and amenities, and the horizontal nature and detailing of the balcony.
- 3) Applicant to return with a site plan which indicates the surveyed lots, including the rear vestige lot and the outline of the rear neighboring building.
- 4) Applicant to return with written note from the Building & Safety Division regarding the acceptability of the proposed property line “windows” per Building Code requirements.
- 5) Show both the existing and proposed site grade and show the 45-foot height limit as measured from the existing or proposed grade, whichever is lower.
- 6) If proposed, provide additional information regarding the proposed gate at the motor court.
- 7) Consider increasing the front planting strip and decrease the hardscape in the front planting strip at the driveway.
- 8) Carry forward comment #5 from ABR March 9, 2009 meeting: *“The Board will continue to look forward to further refinement of the architectural style and detailing”* including incorporating traditional Spanish vernacular detailing.
- 9) Study the potential for additional (larger) openings of the south side motor court.

Action: Mosel/Zink, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Manson-Hing absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

2. 1600 CECIL COOK PL

A-F/SD-3 Zone

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 073-450-003
 Application Number: MST2009-00323
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: MAG Aviation Fuel
 Engineer: Eric Longnecker

(Proposal for a new uncovered self-serve aircraft fueling station limited to aviation use at the Santa Barbara Airport. The proposal includes removing the existing concrete slab, recompaction, and installation of a new 440 square foot concrete slab and footings to support the above ground fuel storage tank. The project requires Planning Commission review for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Comments only; Project requires Environmental Assessment, and Planning Commission review

of a Coastal Development Permit.)

(4:21)

Present: Gary Abbott and Mitch Laskowski, MAG Aviation Fuel.

Public comment opened at 4:29 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Consent Review with comments:

- 1) Ready for Preliminary and Final Approval at Consent Review.
- 2) Applicant to present alternative paint colors for the top portion of the tank; the proposed gray color for the bottom of the tank is acceptable.
- 3) The electronic (telephone) pedestal utility box is to return with color pallet suggestions that would be compatible with the already approved and documented new airport color scheme.
- 4) Remove all references to signage and footings for signage from this application.

Action: Gross/Zink, 6/1/0. Motion carried. (Mosel opposed. Manson-Hing absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**3. 124 LOS AGUAJES AVE****R-4/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-041-007

Application Number: MST2004-00725

Owner: Mark Edwards

Architect: Peter Ehlen

(Proposal to demolish an existing 887 square foot single-family residence and 400 square foot garage and construct three new residential condominiums consisting of two one-bedroom units (1,264 and 1,086 s.f.) and one two-bedroom unit (1,477 s.f.). The project will result in a three-story 3,827 square foot structure with 1,180 square feet in garages on a 6,000 square foot lot located in the Non-Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. A design waiver is requested to allow a garage to be located within three feet of the interior property line. The project requires Planning Commission review for a Tentative Subdivision Map, Coastal Development Permit, and requested zoning modifications to allow encroachments into the required interior and front setbacks.)

(Sixth Concept Review. Comments only; Project requires Environmental Assessment, Compatibility Analysis, and Planning Commission review for a Tentative Subdivision Map, a Coastal Development Permit, and requested zoning modifications.)

(4:42)

Present: Peter Ehlen, Architect; Mark Edwards, Owner; David Black, Landscape Architect; and Suzanne Riegle, Assistant Planner.

Public comment opened at 4:55 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, opposition (submitted written remarks): expressed concern regarding whether the project upholds City standards, and is in keeping with the preservation efforts for the City.

Robert Maxim, opposition: expressed concern regarding the size, bulk, and scale and the requested modification.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Public comment closed at 5:00 p.m.

Staff requested a Compatibility Analysis be made on the project, and further clarification on the modification comments be made by the Board.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with comments:

- 1) A majority of the Board felt that the applicant has sufficiently addressed the previous concerns regarding refinement of the front elevation; the mass, bulk and scale; the reduction of the modifications; and the refinement of the architectural style.
- 2) At least one Board member felt that further refinements should be made to create a more pedestrian-friendly residential experience and additional refinements to the hardscape and landscape.
- 3) A majority of the Board felt that the requested modifications do not pose a negative aesthetic impact and do not adversely add to the proposed project's mass, bulk, and scale or neighborhood compatibility.

Action: Aurell/Rivera, 5/2/0. Motion carried. (Mosel/Gross opposed, Manson-Hing absent).

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**4. 421 N MILPAS ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-303-021
 Application Number: MST2009-00321
 Owner: Steven Wells
 Architect: Burnell Branch & Pester

(Proposal for minor alterations to the existing two-story, 2,366 square foot mixed-use building, comprised of 1,528 square feet of commercial space and an 838 square foot second story residential unit. The proposed alterations include new doors and windows, new wrought iron railing, new awnings, improvements to the courtyard, a new plaster wall, new landscaping, and site improvements including the demolition of an existing shed and "as-built" canopy structure. The proposal includes a change of use from a restaurant/bakery to office. No new square footage is proposed. An existing, detached 515 square foot single-family residential unit will remain unaltered. The proposal will abate ENF2009-00253.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

(5:28)

Present: Britt Jewett, Architect; and Steven Wells, Owner.

Public comment opened at 5:39 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Board.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board finds the overall project acceptable; however, the applicant is encouraged to revise the Milpas Street elevation to address the Urban Design Guidelines to provide a more pedestrian-friendly façade.
- 2) Restudy the use of the proposed Pepper Tree.

Action: Gross/Aurell, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zink stepped down, Manson-Hing absent).

PRELIMINARY REVIEW**5. 617 BRADBURY AVE****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-122-006
 Application Number: MST2007-00559
 Owner: Leed Santa Barbara, LLC
 Architect: AB Design Studio

(The project consists of the demolition of an existing 392 square foot single-family residence, and the construction of a sustainable, 5,488 square foot, three-story, mixed-use building. The proposal will result in two residential condominiums and two commercial condominiums, with an on-grade parking structure. Bicycle parking and a changing room are provided within the garage structure. The residential units are 1,506 square foot, two-bedroom, and three-story units at the rear of the lot. The commercial units are a total of 998 square feet and are located on the first and second floor adjacent to the street. The proposal includes 2,015 square feet of green roof and upper level landscape plantings. The project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 062-09.)

(Project requires compliance with the Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 062-09.)

Postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request.

ADJOURNMENT:

The Full Board meeting adjourned at 5:51 p.m.

CONSENT CALENDAR**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****A. 718 E MASON ST****M-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-121-005
Application Number: MST2007-00056
Owner: Avalos Dora Ontiveros
Architect: Rex Ruskauff
Owner: Jaime Melgoza

(Proposal to construct a new 2,414 square foot, two-story commercial building with office and warehouse space on a 5,016 square foot parcel. Five parking spaces will be provided in a parking lot at the rear of the lot. Parking is in compliance for 1 space per 500 square feet of total square footage. The project requires Development Plan Approval Findings by the Architectural Board of Review for commercial construction between 1,000 to 3,000 square feet. The project received Final Approval on 10/22/07.)

(Review After Final to revise the roll up doors from one 12' by 22' door to a 12' by 11' door on the first floor and a 12' by 8' door at the second floor.)

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Approved as submitted of Review After Final.

REFERRED BY FULL BOARD**B. 226 W DE LA GUERRA ST****R-3/R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-041-015
Application Number: MST2009-00248
Owner: Stephen Harrel and Celeste Exempti
Architect: Stephen Harrel

(Proposal for a 754 square foot two-story addition and remodel to an existing 1,066 square foot, one-story, single-family residence, resulting in a two-unit, 1,820 square foot, two-story, residential duplex on a 6,250 square foot lot. Unit A is a proposed two-story, two-bedroom, 900 square foot residential unit. Unit B is a proposed two-story, two-bedroom, 920 square foot residential unit. Four covered parking spaces will be provided by an existing legal non-conforming detached, 984 square foot, four-car garage. The proposal includes alterations to the existing garage structure to include a new roof, new garage doors, and new exterior paint to match the proposed duplex.)

(Preliminary Approval granted 6/29/09. Final Approval is requested.)

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Final Approval as noted:

1. Roof vents are to be painted to match the existing roof color.

2. Provide pendent lighting at the front doors to match the proposed light fixtures.
3. Landscaping is acceptable as presented.

CONTINUED ITEM

C. 115 E VALERIO ST

R-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-111-012
Application Number: MST2007-00639
Owner: Anne Maxwell
Agent: Souter Land Use Consulting

(Proposal to convert three existing residential units to condominiums. The site is currently developed with a one-story, two-bedroom 1,113 square foot unit, and a two-story, two-bedroom duplex at 1,493 and 1,468 square feet on a 12,500 square foot lot in the R-2 zone. No exterior alterations are proposed for the existing residential units. There are currently two two-car garages on site. The proposal includes some site alterations to include landscaping alterations and the addition of two new uncovered parking spaces, for a total of six on-site parking spaces. A Design Review waiver is requested to not fence the private outdoor living space in the front yard for Unit 1. The project requires Staff Hearing Officer review for Condominium Conversion and a Tentative Subdivision Map.)

(Comments only; Project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer Review for Condominium Conversion and a Tentative Subdivision Map.)

An opposition letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer.

A Design Review waiver has been granted to allow the private outdoor living space (for Unit #1) to be located in the front yard without a fence.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by **Clay Aurell** and **Carol Gross**.