



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, January 14, 2008 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS: MARK WIENKE, Chair
 CHRISTOPHER MANSON-HING, Vice-Chair
 CLAY AURELL
 JIM BLAKELEY
 GARY MOSEL
 RANDY MUDGE
 DAWN SHERRY
 PAUL ZINK

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: GRANT HOUSE
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: BRUCE BARTLETT
STAFF: JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
 MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician
 GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See ABR Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<p><u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street)</p> <p><u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - three sets of <u>folded plans</u> are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised.</p> <p><u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing)</p> <p><u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures.</p> <p><u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.</p>
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc.</p> <p><u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.</p> <p><u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.</p>
	Suggested	<p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p>Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.</p>
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	<p>Same as above with the following additions:</p> <p><u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.</p> <p><u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable.</p> <p><u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.</p> <p><u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan.</p> <p><u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.</p>

GENERAL BUSINESS:

- A. The meeting was called to order at 3:05 p.m. by Jaime Limon, Design Review Supervisor.
- B. Roll call. (Items B and C were heard in reverse order.)
- Members present: Aurell (out 3:46 to 5:54), Blakeley (arrived at 3:11), Manson-Hing, Mosel, Mudge, Sherry (out 6:42 to 7:01), Wienke, Zink (arrived at 3:40)
- Members absent: None
- PC Liaison present: Bartlett
- Council Liaison absent: House
- Staff present: Limon, Shafer, Unzueta (3:25 to 5:40)
- C. Election of Officers.
- Mr. Limon reported that although City Charter requires election of Officer to take place in July, ABR and SFDB meeting procedures were revised stating that election of Officers is to take place in January.
- Nominations for Chair:
- Member Wienkie was nominated for Chair by Member Manson-Hing.
- Vote: 4/0/1. (Mudge abstained: did not wish to violate City Charter. Blakeley and Zink absent.)
- Nominations for Vice Chair:
- Member Sherry was nominated for Vice-Chair by Member Aurell. Member Sherry declined the nomination.
- Member Manson-Hing was nominated for Vice Chair by Member Sherry.
- Vote: 4/0/1. (Mudge abstained: did not wish to violate City Charter. Blakeley and Zink absent.)
- D. Public Comment:
- James Kahan: addressed violations at the T-Mobile wireless antenna site on State Street.
- E. Approval of the minutes. December 17, 2007.
- Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of December 17, 2007, as submitted.
- Action: Sherry/Aurell, 4/0/3. Motion carried. (Manson-Hing, Mosel, Mudge, abstained, Zink absent.)
- F. Consent Calendar.
- Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of January 14, 2008. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Christopher Manson-Hing.
- Action: Manson-Hing/Mosel, 7/0/0. Motion carried. (Zink absent.)
- G. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.
1. No changes to the agenda.
 2. Mr. Limon made the following announcements:
 - a) The NPO update cleanup is scheduled to be heard at Council tomorrow, January 15.

- b) An appeal of 601 Anapamu Street will be heard at Council on January 29. Board member Mudge will attend the hearing.
- 3. Chair Wienke announced that he will step down from Items 1 and 2. He reported that Member Mudge will step down from Item 4.

H. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

I. Possible Ordinance Violations.

Chair Wienke reported building façade renovations are taking place at La Cumbre Plaza Mall that might not have not been reviewed by the ABR. Mr. Limon replied the projects might have received approvals at Consent Calendar. He will contact the mall manager to go over the project reviews and report back to the Board.

Public comment: Katy O'Riley-Rogers, Landscape Architect reported that the London Plane trees specified in the approved landscape plan for La Cumbre Plaza Mall were replaced with four King Palm trees along the parking lot side of the extended sidewalks.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

1. 601 E MICHELTORENA ST

C-O Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-270-030
 Application Number: MST2003-00827
 Owner: Santa Barbara Cottage Hospital Foundation
 Agent: Ken Marshall
 Architect: Cearnal, Andrulaitis, LLP

(The Santa Barbara Cottage Hospital Foundation Workforce Housing Project will remove the former St. Francis Hospital complex, including the main hospital, convent, central plant, and other ancillary structures and construct 115 residential condominiums that will cover approximately 5.94 acres of the 7.39 acre site. Eighty-one of the units will be sold to Cottage Hospital employees at prices within the City's structure for affordable units and 34 units will be sold at market rates. The project will provide approximately 265 parking spaces, including 254 parking spaces for the 115 condominium units and 11 spaces for the Villa Riviera facility.)

(THE PROJECT WAS APPROVED BY THE PLANNING COMMISSION ON SEPTEMBER 21, 2006 AND BY THE CITY COUNCIL ON DECEMBER 19, 2006.)

(Preliminary Approval of project is requested. Substantial Conformance determination is required by Community Development Director.)

(3:25)

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect; Joe Andrulaitis, Architect; Katy O'Riley-Rogers, Landscape Architect; Irma Unzueta, Project Planner.

Ms. Unzueta provided staff comments related to Substantial Conformance and stated that the project requires a courtesy review by the HLC prior to receiving Preliminary Approval by the ABR.

Public comment opened at 5:23 p.m.

- Tony Fisher, representing St. Francis Friends and Neighbors, opposed. Submitted in writing his comments to the HLC. HLC is to be involved in review of neighborhood compatibility, site design, and architecture. Concerned that ABR did not receive accurate data earlier.
- Dale Francisco, HLC approval is called out in PC condition's of approval, therefore Preliminary Approval cannot be granted.
- Sydney Siemens, opposed. Concerned with loss of views, potential view of new roof tops, density, and potential decreased property values.

Public comment closed at 5:37 p.m.

Member Zink requested staff provide a flow chart of all Boards involved in the project.

Member Sherry requested that staff verify the project's substantial conformance.

Continued two weeks to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Site: a) study the planter heights for the total effect, especially between the private outdoor spaces. Dividing plants can remain at their proposed height; consider reducing the heights of those within private spaces. b) Provide information on surface finishes of exterior stairs and walkways. c) The Board looks forward to reviewing the refined landscaping redesign, with planters and shrubs, etc.
- 2) Overall project: provide cut sheets of garage and entry doors.
- 3) Unit B: add another (psidium) tree to the west elevation.
- 4) Unit D1: continue refining the covered entry in relation to the elevator shaft structure and planters.
- 5) Unit D2: continue to refine/restudy the proportions of the plaster corbelling at the entries.
- 6) Unit D3: continue to refine/restudy the proportions of the plaster corbelling at the entries.
- 7) Unit F1: restudy the proportion of the covered entries for extension compatibility with planters and/or grade.
- 8) Unit F2: no comment.
- 9) Lower H3 Unit: lower the second floor plaster portion of the guardrail area at the back elevation.
- 10) Unit O1: study the location of the roof corbels to window. Use a stone base at columns and at railing.
- 11) Unit O2: no comment.
- 12) Unit O3: eliminate the wood band at the elevations.
- 13) Unit P: use a stone base at columns and railings.
- 14) Unit R: no comments.
- 15) Unit S1: continue refining the covered entries.
- 16) Unit RS1: no comment.
- 17) Unit RS2: no comment.
- 18) Unit RSS: lower the highest stone wall portion at the rear elevation and have an open metal railing. Study the street elevation for an optimum landscaping experience for the pedestrian against the high walls.
- 19) Review of the November 19, 2007 ABR comments for units H, J, K and M, as well as public comment, is continued to the next ABR meeting.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM**2. 350 HITCHCOCK WAY****E-3/PD/SD-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-240-003
 Application Number: MST2007-00613
 Owner: Clayton, Troutt and Company III, LLP
 Owner: Ralph Horowitz
 Architect: Cearnal, Andrulaitis, LLP

(Proposal to construct a 3,386 square foot one-story addition to an existing automobile dealership building. The project scope includes the demolition of 1,850 square feet of existing service bays and an enclosed area and interior and exterior remodel to the building that includes a facade remodel, reconstruction of service bays and a new 2,100 square foot canopy structure. Development Plan Approval findings are required at ABR for the new addition of 1,486 square feet.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND DEVELOPMENT PLAN APPROVAL FINDINGS BY THE ABR.)

(5:40)

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect; Architect, Lovita Wibisono, Associate, Architect; and Brian Gibbons, Staubach Realty; Dave Humphreys, RHL Design.

Public comment opened at 5:46 p.m.

- A comment letter from Ginger Wagner was read into the record.
- T. Gerig: concerned about noise impacts, dumpster location; buffering of carwash facilities; public address system; would prefer off-street customer parking.

Public comment closed at 5:51 p.m.

Motion: Continued four weeks to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) The proposed improvements, canopy, color and finish of the existing structure are going in an acceptable direction.
- 2) The Board would like to view the total streetscape property, not just the South portion of the property.
- 3) Provide consideration of noise generating elements and take noise mitigation measures.
- 4) Exterior lighting shall comply with City Standards for dealerships.

Action: Zink/Mosel, 6/0/1. Motion carried. (Aurell abstained. Wienke stepped down)

***** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 6:15 P.M. TO 6:42 P.M. *****

PRELIMINARY REVIEW**3. 302 S VOLUNTARIO ST****R-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-281-010
Application Number: MST2007-00551
Owner: Mark Williams
Architect: William Cooper

(Proposal to demolish an existing 882 square foot single-family residence and 171 square foot garage and construct a two-story, three-unit apartment building consisting of a 1,287 square foot two-bedroom unit, two 847 square foot one-bedroom units, and three attached one-car garages totaling 667 square feet. The proposed development will consist of 2,981 residential square footage on a 6,250 square foot parcel.)

(Preliminary Approval is requested.)

(6:42)

Present: William Cooper, Architect; Mark Williams, Owner.

Public comment opened at 6:50 p.m.

A letter from Paula Westbury was acknowledged by the Chair.

Public comment closed at 6:51 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) The Board is happy with the direction the project moving in, with the following concern still to be addressed: there is concern with the materials as presented. The S-tile, and the vinyl windows, per se, in that the simple use of the boxy simple form of the building would require more substantial and better quality materials as part of the architectural style.
- 2) Northeast elevation: the Board is concerned with the flat arch surround condition of the front entry. Applicant to study for other solutions that provide more attractive detailing at the door area as presented in the surrounding neighborhood, and the use of a sill and a header "drippy" condition that may help articulate the punched openings in that façade.
- 3) Entire building: the Board is not convinced of the eave detailing around the roof edge. Applicant to revise for a less bulky, less commercial look, and for a residential look more in harmony with the simple style of the massing.
- 4) Southeast elevation: relocate the electric meters from their proposed location and place them at the left side of the building, allowing for a more pleasing entry experience to Unit C. Remove the entry door to dining room of Unit A.
- 5) The Board is split and unconvinced of the continuous corbel detailing over the door for the cantilever on the Southwest elevation. Suggestions include restudying that area to indicate corbels that are relative to structural bay that would be represented by that cantilevered condition.
- 6) There is concern with the openings to the second-story deck of both units, the flat arch condition and its relationship to the rest of the architecture. Solutions include squarer openings and smaller openings, and other conditions that may help articulate those openings, potentially including sills and corbels.

- 7) There is concern as to whether the square openings as shown in sections A and B work with the larger openings on the adjacent wall to the deck areas. Applicant to study those areas. Consider smaller openings in greater numbers.
- 8) Consider having four corbels on the garage, one over each structural element and flat on the rest.
- 9) Colors as presented for the wall plane and window material are too similar. A more striking contrast between the two materials is preferred.
- 10) There is concern that the 42 inch entry pilasters are over detailed in their classical vernacular, simplify to match the structure.

Action: Sherry/Mudge, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW

4. 924 JIMENO RD

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-052-009
 Application Number: MST2005-00672
 Owner: Herendeen Family Trust
 Applicant: Vadim Hsu
 Landscape Architect: Randy Mudge

(Proposal to construct a new 1,392 square foot first- and second-floor addition to an existing 1,657 square foot residence, demolish the existing 262 square foot two-car garage and construct a 500 square foot garage on an 8,623 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District. A Modification was approved on January 18, 2006 to allow a stairway to encroach into the side yard setback.)

(Final Approval may be granted if sufficient information is provided.)

(7:36)

Present: Vadim Hsu, Applicant.

Public comment opened at 7:46 p.m.

- Russ Jones, opposed: concerned with the lack of noticing.
- Shelly Johnson, opposed: project is proposed to be built on highest portion of the lot.
- Chair Wienke read into the record comment letters from Clay and Linda Cole, and Reed and Benita Wilson; and acknowledged receipt of a signed petition.

Public comment closed at 7:58 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval with the following conditions:

- 1) Revise the chimney to be thinner at the north/south elevations as shown on the roof plan and elevation pages.
- 2) Resolve the north elevation bay window connection to the wall with plaster detailing.
- 3) Show how storm water from the driveway will be diverted to the retention areas surrounding the driveway.

Action: Mosel/Sherry, 4/0/3. (Aurell, Blakely, Zink abstained. Mudge stepped down.)

PRELIMINARY REVIEW**5. 500 FOWLER RD****A-F/SD-3 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 073-450-003
 Application Number: MST2007-00002
 Owner: Santa Barbara Airport
 Architect: Fred Sweeney
 Architect: Joseph Grogan

(Proposal for construction of a new two-story Airline Terminal facility measuring approximately 66,045 square feet. The new facility would be located south of the existing 20,000 square foot main Terminal building, which would remain in operation during construction. The original 5,000 SF 1942 Terminal building would be rehabilitated, with additions constructed in 1967 and 1976 to be removed. The 1942 building would be relocated and incorporated as part of the new facility. The existing rental car/security operations building, airline trailers and baggage claim pavilions, which are currently part of the existing Terminal complex would also be removed and the uses would be incorporated into the new terminal. The existing short-term parking lot would be reconfigured and the loop road would be revised to incorporate an alternative transportation lane for buses, taxis, and shuttles. The project requires approval by the Planning Commission.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 039-07.)

(8:14)

Present: Fred Sweeney, Architect; Thea Van Loggerenberg, Justine Leon Ramsdale, Landscape Architect; Lori Owens, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara.

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Lower the tower buttress to be more in keeping with the previous condition where it does not conflict with the ornate tower top.
- 2) Restudy the dome top of the tower for a potential eave condition that provides better visibility of the dome from the pedestrian level.
- 3) The Board likes the mirror door replacement windows. The metal work should have ornate detailing as shown on the sketch.
- 4) There is support for the elimination of baggage cart nonstructural columns. Study the proportions of the remaining columns and the possibility of extending the fins on the second level above in connection with the columns below so as to not appear too top heavy or fin-like.
- 5) Study the buttresses at the entry area of the plaza, from the existing terminal into the new building. The Board would prefer simplified buttresses.
- 6) The interiors and surfaces and materials are acceptable to the board. Although the
- 7) Stained concrete on the second level is preferred, but the Board understands there are budget constraints.
- 8) The Board would prefer having stone in terrace areas where accessible to the public.
- 9) Provide paver caps on second story areas.
- 10) Indicate on the plans a location for future elevator installation.

Action: Manson-Hing/Mudge, 5/2/1. (Aurel abstained. Mosel and Mudge opposed.)

J. The Full Board meeting adjourned at 10:10 p.m.**CONSENT CALENDAR (1:00)****REVIEW AFTER FINAL****A. 1316 BATH ST****R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-121-020
Application Number: MST2001-00822
Owner: Marlies Marburg
Architect: Larry Thompson

(The proposal involves the conversion and partial demolition of a 468 square foot two-car garage to a 374 square foot hotel room for the Glenborough Inn. A 70 square foot addition is proposed to join the converted garage to the main building, which includes four existing hotel rooms. Proposed above the converted hotel room (Unit #5) is a 282 square foot hotel room (Unit #4). The former Unit #4 would be converted into a breakfast pavilion for the hotel guests. A 64 square foot gazebo is also proposed. Three uncovered parking spaces would be provided on site and two uncovered parking spaces would continue to be provided at the main site of Glenborough Inn, located at 1327 Bath Street. The main site includes five additional bed and breakfast units. One of the existing parking spaces in a three-car garage at 1327 Bath Street would be converted to a storage room resulting in a total of seven on-site parking spaces. The discretionary applications required for this project are modifications to allow Unit #5 to be located within the rear and interior yard setbacks, for the 70 square foot addition to be located within the interior yard setback, for Unit #4 to be located in the rear yard setback and for the converted storage room to encroach into the required rear yard setback.)

(Project requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 001-05.)

(Review After Final to revise trash compartment area.)

Continued one week for additional landscape details.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**B. 1346 MANITOU RD****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 049-210-010
Application Number: MST2006-00247
Owner: Robert K. and Madalene I. Towery
Applicant: Robert Towery

(As-built retaining walls/fencing to abate zoning violations and reinstallation of garage door. All buildings to be refinished smooth sand finish stucco, replacing the windows, replacing doors, installation of new windows and changing the colors.)

(Review After Final for addition of a 3 foot guardrail.)

Final Approval with the condition that the applicant is to provide additional wrought iron fencing details.

FINAL REVIEW**C. 519 DE LA VINA ST****R-3/R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-161-011
Application Number: MST2006-00668
Owner: Edward L. Fuller
Applicant: Roger Eggers

(Proposal to abate violations per ENF2006-00569 including removal of an illegal room at rear kitchen doors, removal of the rear deck and stairs, and construction of a new 75 square feet rear porch and access stairs, and removal of the illegal storage rooms in the side yard setback. The property is an 8,733 square foot lot developed with a single-family residence in the front and a duplex in the rear.)

(Final Approval is requested.)

Final Approval as submitted.

FINAL REVIEW**D. 1811 LOMA ST****R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-072-006
Application Number: MST2007-00477
Owner: Charles Crail
Architect: Joseph Moticha

(Proposal to demolish the existing back decks and stairways and replace with new decks and a circular stairway. The proposal also includes replacing the existing garbage enclosures, resurfacing the back wall of the building where the stairways and decks are being removed, and replacement of four rear single doors with four new double French doors.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Final Approval as submitted.

FINAL REVIEW**E. 418 E CANON PERDIDO ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-022-002
Application Number: MST2007-00505
Owner: Jack G. Duncan, Revocable Trust
Architect: Alex Pujo

(Proposal for an exterior façade renovation and addition of a 26 square foot area to accommodate an enclosed chair lift for ADA compliance. The addition of a handicap accessible bathroom is also proposed. Six existing parking spaces will be maintained.)

(Final Approval is requested.)

Continued one week.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by Christopher Manson-Hing. Consent Calendar ended at 12:40 p.m.