



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

Monday, November 27, 2006 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS:
 BRUCE BARTLETT, Chair, Present
 JAMES LECRON, Vice-Chair, Present
 JIM BLAKELEY, Present
 CHRISTOPHER MANSON-HING, Present
 GARY MOSEL, Present
 RANDY MUDGE, Present (arrived at 3:10 p.m.)
 DAWN SHERRY, Present (arrived at 3:11 p.m.)
 MARK WIENKE, Present

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: GRANT HOUSE, Absent

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON, Absent

STAFF:
 JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor, Absent
 JOANNE LA CONTE, Assistant Planner, Present
 GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary, Present

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See ABR Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following Architectural Board of Review (ABR) agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, a rescheduling fee will be paid and the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) in addition to submitting appropriate plans.
- All approvals made by the ABR are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.68 and with adopted ABR guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- The ABR may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- The Board may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Architectural Board of Review approval.
- Preliminary and Final Architectural Board of Review approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension or Building Permit has been granted.
- **Items before the Board may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Said appeal must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Board took action or rendered its decision. The scope of this project may be modified under further review.**
- **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at (805) 564-5470. Notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.
- **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Kelly Brodison, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to noon and 1:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

1. That on Wednesday, November 22, 2006 at 4:00 p.m., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov.
2. This regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review will be broadcast live and rebroadcast in its entirety on Wednesday at 8:00 a.m. on Channel 18.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Architectural Board of Review for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes:

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of November 20, 2006, with corrections.

Action: LeCron/Wienke, 6/0/0. (Mudge and Sherry absent)

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by James LeCron with the exception of the landscaping for Items A reviewed by Randy Mudge.

Action: Mudge/Manson-Hing, 8/0/0.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

Ms. La Conte announced that Item #7, 1380 Shorline Drive, is continued one week at the applicant's request.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

Board member Manson-Hing reported that the description of work on file for 333 Marina Drive does not appear to be an accurate description of the work taking place.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**1. 3475 MARINA DR**

A-1/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 047-022-003

Application Number: MST2000-00300

Owner: Stephen & Marianne Blick

Architect: Eberhard & Associates

Landscape Architect: Sam Maphis

(Proposal to construct a new 5,520 square foot, one-story residence with an attached three-car garage, new swimming pool and tennis court on a vacant 58,830 square foot lot.)

(Review after Final for change in wall height along Cliff Drive from 6' to no more than 8' at various spots along the street to coincide with natural grade.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES SUBSTANTIAL CONFORMANCE DETERMINATION WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 040-00.)

**** BOARD MEMBERS WERE REQUESTED TO CONDUCT INDEPENDENT SITE VISITS****

(3:13)

Present: Andy Roteman, Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:26 p.m. The following individuals spoke in favor or opposition.

Arthur Schwartz, resident, opposed.

Michael Moore, resident, opposed.

Ronald Green, resident, opposed.

Susan Green, resident, opposed.

Chair Bartlett read into the record letters and e-mails expressing concern with the wall height, and loss of ocean views. Letters were submitted by the following residents: Bill Spraker, Patricia Foley, HOA President, Mark Fill, and Ralph & Patricia Winkler, and Arthur Schwartz.

Public comment closed at 3:37 p.m.

Motion: Denial of the Review After Final.

Action: Mudge/Mosel, 0/0/0. Board Member Mudge withdrew the motion.

Motion: Approval of a wall no taller than the previously approved 6-feet, or relocate the wall to a location where the top of the wall will be no more than 6' exposed to public view.

Action: Mudge/. Motion failed due to lack of a second.

Substitute

Motion: **Final Approval of the Review After Final with the following comment:**

Approval of the changes to the structure with the exception of the scope of work regarding Item #'s 2 and 9. The privacy wall along Cliff Drive is to remain as previously approved at 6-feet, and without pilasters.

Action: LeCron/Manson-Hing. 6/2/0. Sherry and Mosel opposed.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**2. 434 W GUTIERREZ ST**

R-4 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-191-002

Application Number: MST2006-00541

Owner: Lorenz Weidl

Architect: Bildsten & Sherwin Design Studio

(Proposal for a three-unit, three-story apartment building to be attached to an existing 1,707 square foot single-family dwelling. The three units total 5,334 square feet and there would be four two-car garages totaling 1,750 square feet on the lower level. The project includes converting three existing 281 square foot garages to storage space, and a total of 50 cubic yards of grading. Modifications are requested to allow encroachments into the front yard setbacks along West Gutierrez Street and Rancheria Street and to provide less than the required amount of open space.)

(Second Concept Review.)**(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND STAFF HEARING OFFICER APPROVAL FOR MODIFICATIONS.)**

(4:10)

Present: Ellen Bildten, Architect.

Public comment opened at 4:19 p.m.

Josef Meyr, resident, opposed to the proposed height, and mass.

Public comment closed at 4:20 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

1) The majority of Board members are concerned that the mass, bulk, and scale is increasing in an effort to improve the articulation of the structure. **2)** The increased roof heights, especially in the central portion of the building, appear to make compliance with solar design guidelines and third level setbacks on Rancheria Street hard to achieve. **3)** The Board is concerned with the plan layout of the existing house for Unit #1, it appears to be 2 or 3 units without the associated required parking. Unit 1 should be thoroughly depicted as to its design intent. **4)** The applicant is encouraged to use the Gutierrez Street frontage for a true front door effect on the porch, which the Board would like to see remain even though it is located in the front setback. **5)** The materiality appears to be moving in right direction. The use of additional board and batt siding is helping the articulation of portions of the architecture. The change in materiality from the plaster to the board and batt would be more successful if there was a plane change associated with the wall conditions. **6)** The choice of materials for Unit #1 should be restudied to integrate that structure more into the final composition of the project. **7)** There is concern with accuracy of the drawings especially relative to the vertical heights and the lack of sections through the building. **8)** There is a question whether the three levels at the north end of the project are achievable given the lack of topographical information, dimensions, and finished floor elevations. **9)** Introduce planting pockets or a continuous planter along the eastern edge of the driveway abutting the adjacent neighbor.

Action: Mosel/Wienke, 8/0/0. Motion carried.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW**3. 1236 SAN ANDRES ST**

R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-151-001
 Application Number: MST2006-00364
 Owner: Ruth Mudry Trust 11/17/94
 Architect: Kirk Gradin
 Owner: Casas Del Parque, LLC
 Applicant: Blakenship Construction

(Proposal to construct four two-story residential condominium units. Three of these would be approximately 1,000 square feet and one would be approximately 1,100 square feet. Each unit would have an attached two-car garage for a total of eight parking spaces on the 10,048 square foot parcel. The proposal includes demolition of all existing structures and there would be 140 yards of cut and fill grading outside the building footprints. The project will require Staff Hearing officer approval for a Tentative Subdivision Map.)

(Review of the Landscape Plan is requested.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND STAFF HEARING OFFICER APPROVAL FOR A TENTATIVE SUBDIVISION MAP.)

(4:55)

Present: Kirk Gradin, Architect; Jeff Yardy, Earthform.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer and return to Full Board with the following comments:

1) Study the northern property line fencing, egress and planting requirements. **2)** As to the landscape: **a.** Provide planting in the parkway; **b.** Delineate adequate root areas, or planters, for the trees. **c.** Verify that the size of trees proposed can be planted where shown on the plans; **d.** Show what is proposed from the City's standpoint related to the landscaping in the adjacent park. **3)** Study the aspects of tagging and theft as they relate to the style of fence. **4)** The Board is pleased with the creek restoration effort at rear of property.

Action: Wienke/LeCron, 8/0/0.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**4. 1209 MANITOU RD**

R-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-010-029
 Application Number: MST2006-00658
 Owner: Miles Paine
 Architect: Lori Kari

(Proposal for a 712 square foot addition to an existing 2,131 square foot two-story dwelling with a 370 square foot attached garage on a 10,229 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The proposal includes a 181 square foot second floor addition, a new 531 square foot third floor, a 335 square foot roof terrace, and a 75 square foot balcony.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND NEIGHBORHOOD PRESERVATION ORDINANCE FINDINGS.)

(5:27)

Present: Lori Kari, Architect.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Consent Calendar with the following comments:

- 1) The project is ready for final approval, pending Environmental Assessment.
- 2) Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance findings may be made on Consent Calendar.
- 3) Provide high quality detailing.

Action: Manson-Hing/Wienke, 8/0/0.

***** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 5:43 P.M. UNTIL 6:25 P.M. *****

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

5. 126 N ALISOS ST

R-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-093-017
Application Number: MST2006-00666
Owner: Alicia Fernandez
Designer: Jose Esparza

(Proposal for partial demolition and rebuilding of an existing 1,126 square foot one-story single-family residence. The proposal includes the construction of a 310 square foot second-story, a 137 square foot front porch, an 18 square foot second-story deck, extension of a garden wall adjacent to the driveway, widening the driveway by 3 feet, and demolition of 241 square feet of the existing first-floor space. There are two units on the 5,000 square foot parcel with no proposed alterations to the rear unit.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT.)

(6:25)

Present: Jose Esparza, Designer.

Public comment opened at 6:33 p.m.

Chair Bartlett read into the record letters expressing concern with loss of driveway access, and opposition to the two-story construction. Letters were submitted by: David Edsall, Attorney for Rosa Bortolazzo; and Martin and Pandora Moriarty.

Public comment closed at 6:36 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) The Board finds the overall notion of the minimal second story addition to be going in right direction; however, further study is needed of the articulation and the location of some of the programmatic parts. The Board is struggling with the tall two-story nature of the stairwell as it is presented to the street. 2) There is concern with the east facing second-story balcony that overlooks the adjacent neighbor. Consider moving the second

story mass further from the street and restudy the relationship of the stairs and the upper level balcony to address those issues. **3)** The Board looks for simplification of the roof forms to emulate the Dutch-gable as presented on the west elevation and continued use of the gable elsewhere in the project so that it does not stand out as a single application. **4)** Restudy the roof form of the front porch roof where it intersects the main roof on the west elevation. **5)** Introduce charm giving elements on the front building of the proposal. **6)** Increase landscape opportunities where ever possible and provide photographs of the proposed open yard space. There is concern that current photographs depict mostly hardscape around the two existing buildings. **7)** Provide a landscape plan for the front and driveway side of the front residence.

Action: Wienke/Blakeley, 8/0/0.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

6. 2202 DE LA VINA ST

R-4 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-183-018
 Application Number: MST2006-00470
 Owner: John Chapman
 Architect: Jyl Ratkevich

(Proposal for an 890 square foot second-floor addition and a 67 square foot first-floor addition to an existing 889 square foot one-story single family residence. A modification is requested to provide one uncovered parking space in place of a required covered space, and a waiver is requested for the undersized covered space in the existing shared two-car garage.)

(Modification approved on November 8, 2006.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES NEIGHBORHOOD PRESERVATION ORDINANCE FINDINGS.)

(6:53)

Present: Jyl Ratkevich, Architect.

Motion: Continued two weeks to the Full Board with the following comments:

1) The Board finds that the majority of the revisions have been successful; however, the second-story decks on the south-west façade are creating an eyebrow-roof effect, which the Board was hoping to eliminate by stepping the second-story back. Consider either eliminating the decks or another solution that allows for a true roof form expression at the first to second floor on that street facade. **2)** The majority of the Board is concerned with the complexity of the inter-relationship of the ground level rear porch and the upper level balcony, especially where they intersect on the north-east elevation. Restudy the upper balcony to minimize the size and the impact to the adjacent neighbor, and to avoid conflict with the porch below. **3)** The Board prefers a brick veneer at the fireplace elements in keeping with the original brick chimneys. **4)** The Board is not in favor of the plaster columns at the rear porch as depicted. The Board prefers either: **a.** that the rear porch column bases use brick to emulate the front porch, or, **b.** redesign the rear porch in a more simplistic fashion so as not to be in competition with the front porch element.

Action: Wienke/Sherry, 8/0/0.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW**7. 1380 SHORELINE DR**

E-3/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-193-018
Application Number: MST2004-00873
Owner: Mark & Jacquelyn Boyd
Architect: Dawn Sherry

(Proposal to construct approximately 992 square feet of first and second-story additions and a new attached 400 square foot garage to an existing 999 square foot single-family residence with an attached two-car garage on a 6,190 square foot lot in the Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone. The proposal includes removal of 97 square feet from the existing residence and garage and conversion of 341 square feet of garage to habitable space with a new window in the required front yard setback and associated improvements.)

(Preliminary Approval is requested)

(PROJECT REQUIRES NEIGHBORHOOD PRESERVATION ORDINANCE FINDINGS AND COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 028-06)

Continued one week at the applicant's request.

CONSENT CALENDAR**REFERRED BY FULL BOARD****A. 1232 CHINO ST**

R-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-142-022
Application Number: MST2006-00218
Owner: Salvador & Maria Barragan
Designer: Darlene Allen

(Proposal for a one-story 1,763 square foot three-bedroom single-family residence including an attached 433 square foot two-car garage to replace an existing 929 square foot single-story residence. The 10,750 square foot lot contains an existing one-story duplex, a three-car garage, and two uncovered parking spaces which will remain.)

(Final Approval of the Architecture and Landscape Plan is requested.)

Final Approval of the Architecture as noted on the plans. Final Approval of the landscape.

FINAL REVIEW**B. 1703 SANTA BARBARA ST**

R-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-111-008
Application Number: MST2006-00454
Owner: Santa Barbara-Valerio LLC
Architect: Brian Nelson

(Proposal to convert an existing 2,658 square foot two-story duplex to a single-family residence. The project includes exterior remodeling, a 358 square foot two-story addition, interior alterations, an elevator, and site and landscape improvements on the 6,116 square foot lot. The existing attached two-car garage will be retained. Modifications are requested for work to encroach into three setbacks and into the required open-yard area.)

(Final Approval of the colors and materials is requested.)

Final Approval as submitted of the color and materials.

NEW ITEM**C. 2221 ST JAMES DR**

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 049-261-014
Application Number: MST2006-00683
Owner: Peder Jan Estrup & Faiza Fawaz
Architect: James Zimmerman

(Proposal for a 20 square foot two-story elevator shaft at the rear of the residence, approximate height of 20 feet.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND NEIGHBORHOOD PRESERVATION ORDINANCE FINDINGS.)

Continued one week at applicant's request.

NEW ITEM**D. 1411 SAN ANDRES ST**

C-P/R-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-032-020
Application Number: MST2006-00670
Owner: Days E Et Al Trustees (for) Days
Applicant: Bradley Miles

(This is an enforcement case #ENF2004-00259. Proposal to remodel the existing bakery and add 16' x 9' cooler in the rear of the shop and an 8 foot x 6 foot wall. Remodel front facade and exterior color change.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT)

Continued one week at the applicant's request.

CONTINUED ITEM**E. 3343 STATE ST**

C-P/SD-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-063-004
Application Number: MST2006-00678
Owner: Harz Family Trust 1/6/05
Applicant: Steve Llebaria
Business Name: Via Maestro 42

(Proposal for a retractable awning on the store front of Via Maestra 42 to project 8 feet from the wall and to be approximately 30 feet long to provide a covered outdoor dining area.)

(ACTION MAY BE TAKEN IF SUFFICIENT INFORMATION IS PROVIDED.)

Final Approval as submitted.

CONTINUED ITEM**F. 812 LARGURA PL**

A-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-110-034
Application Number: MST2006-00645
Owner: Elizabeth Vos

(Proposal to permit the "as-built" deck, change the existing aluminum windows and doors to Milgard vinyl, change the body trim, exterior color change, and picket spacing on the upper rear balcony on a 1.08 acre lot in the Hillside Design District. The lot is currently developed with a 1,584 square foot single-family residence with a 400 square foot attached garage.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES NEIGHBORHOOD PRESERVATION ORDINANCE FINDINGS.)

Preliminary Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.68.060 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code and continued one week to Consent Calendar.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:15 P.M. ****